DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 335 485 CE 058 611

TITLE	State-Level Measurement of Performance Outcomes in Postsecondary Vocational Education. Volume II: Appendix. Profiles of State Date Collection Activities.
INSTITUTION	Research and Evaluation Associates, Inc., Washington, DC.
SPONS AGENCY	Department of Education, Washington, DC. Office of Planning, Budget, and Evaluation.
PUB DATE	91
NOTE	209p.; For Volume I, "An Overview of State Policies", see CE 058 610.
PUB TYPE	Reports - Research/Technical (143)
EDRS PRICE	MF01/PC09 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS	Academic Achievement; Data Analysis; *Data Collection; Educational Assessment; *Educational Policy; Evaluation Methods; Evaluation Utilization; Followup Studies; *Outcomes of Education; Postsecondary Education; Program Descriptions; Program Effectiveness; Program Evaluation; Proprietary Schools; Public Schools; State Legislation; *State Programs; Statewide Planning; *Vocational Education

ABSTRACT

This report presents the detailed results of the compilation of an overview of state activities related to measuring the outcomes of postsecondary vocational education. Chapter I provides background to the study. Chapter II describes the methodology used for the development of the overview, including discussions with experts, the information collection plan, and pilot test. Chapter III presents narrative summaries of the information compiled on each state, provided in alphabetical order by state name. The general format includes a description of the organization of vocational education in the state and estimates of the number of schools and students. Separate descriptions follow for public postsecondary vocational education, vocational-technical schools (if different policies and practices apply), and proprietary institutions. For each component of postsecondary vocational education, the information assembled on the outcome measures collected, collection methods, data verification, data analysis, and uses are presented. Recently passed legislation and other indications of change in the policies and practices are also provided. Each discussion concludes with a section that highlights the most significant feature(s) related to the collection of outcome measures within the state. Chapter IV displays the key elements from the summaries in a matrix. (YLB)

****
*   Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made   *
*   from the original document.   *
****

State-Level Measurement of Performance Outcomes in Postsecondary Vocational Education

Volume II: Appendix
Profiles of State Data Collection Activities

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality

- Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy

Prepared Under Contract for the U.S. Department of Education by:

Research and Evaluation Associates, Inc.
Washington, DC

CE 058811

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION • OFFICE OF PLANNING, BUDGET & EVALUATION

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

The views that are expressed in this report are those of the contractor; they do not necessarily reflect or express the views of the U.S. Department of Education.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Any undertaking of this magnitude requires the assistance and cooperation of many individuals and organizations. The staff of Research and Evaluation Associates is indebted to those individuals in many different organizations at the state level who were able to provide us with information about the operation of community colleges, area vocational-technical schools, proprietary vocational institutions, and other postsecondary vocational education institutions and organizations. These persons graciously provided us with their assistance in compiling the information for this document through a series of telephone interviews and written correspondence.

Richard N. White and Joseph F. Haenn
Project Directors

For additional information about this project, please contact:

Dr. David Goodwin
Office of Planning, Budget and Evaluation
U.S. Department of Education
400 Maryland Avenue, S.W.
FOB-6, Room 3135
Washington, DC 20202
(202) 401-0182

TABLE OF CONTENTS

SECTION PAGE

I. INTRODUCTION 1
Background 2
Contents of This Report 4

II. METHODOLOGY 5
Discussions with Experts 5
Information Collection Plan 5
Pilot Test 7

III. NARRATIVE SUMMARIES 11
Alabama 13
Alaska 15
Arizona 19
Arkansas 25
California 28
Colorado 31
Connecticut 37
Delaware 41
District of Columbia 43
Florida 44
Georgia 49
Hawaii 52
Idaho 55
Illinois 58
Indiana 64
Iowa 67
Kansas 70
Kentucky 73
Louisiana 76
Maine 78
Maryland 80
Massachusetts 86
Michigan 88
Minnesota 91
Mississippi 97
Missouri 100
Montana 102
Nebraska 104
Nevada 110
New Hampshire 111
New Jersey 113
New Mexico 115
New York 122
North Carolina 125
North Dakota 128

Ohio 131
Oklahoma 135
Oregon 141
Pennsylvania 145
Rhode Island 147
South Carolina 149
South Dakota 154
Tennessee 156
Texas 160
Utah 162
Vermont 168
Virginia 170
Washington 173
West Virginia 178
Wisconsin 180
Wyoming 185
Puerto Rico 188

IV. INFORMATION MATRIX 194
Column Definitions 194
Outcome Measures Collected at State Level 194
Other Characteristics of Outcome Measurement 197
The Matrices 198

V. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS 205

APPENDIX A. LIST OF INFORMATION ELEMENTS 209

APPENDIX B. OVERSIGHT AGENCY FOR EACH COMPONENT OF POSTSECONDARY VOCATIONAL EDUCATION 216

LIST OF TABLES

Table Page

I-1. National Experts and Organizations Contacted. 6
VI-1. Categorization of States by Level of Outcome Measurement and Consumer Rights Activity 218

STATE-LEVEL MEASUREMENT OF PERFORMANCE OUTCOMES IN POSTSECONDARY EDUCATION

Volume II: Appendix
Profiles of State Data Collection Activities

I. INTRODUCTION

This report presents the detailed results of the compilation of an overview of state activities related to measuring the outcomes of postsecondary vocational education. An overview of the general study findings is presented in Volume I: Executive Summary: An Overview of State Policies. The effort was directed at several aspects of outcome measurement: 1) what measures were collected; 2) how the measures were defined and how the necessary data was collected; 3) what attempts were made to validate the measures reported to the state; 4) what analyses of the data were performed at the state level; and 5) what uses were made of the measures, whether for management or for consumer rights, including reporting within the state education agency, reporting to the governor's office and legislature, reporting back to the schools, or reporting to the public. The charge was to provide a snapshot of the practices in place during the 1989-1990 school year nationwide. The document is designed to familiarize policymakers with more detailed reporting of study findings. The objectives are to provide descriptions, and not to provide evidence of the effectiveness of specific procedures and policies. However, where possible, this document highlights elements of the outcome measurement process that merit special attention in future policy considerations because of apparent threats to the validity of the measures, or because of problems in implementation or acceptance.

Of the fifty states, District of Columbia, and Puerto Rico, no state[1] was found to have had an outcome measurement policy in place and unchanged for more than two years. The majority of states have either initiated new policies for collecting outcomes data, have expanded or improved their collection practices, have passed laws to make changes that will be implemented in the near future, or have introduced bills in the state legislature seeking authorization for similar changes.

This report reveals that the states vary widely in the outcome measures they have selected to collect, the definitions of those measures, the method of collection, the analysis of these data, and the uses for which they are intended. Other than the pace of change and a consistent movement to increase the levels of activity in the collection of outcome measures, no patterns in the variation have been identified.

Background

Public interest in the issue of consumer information in postsecondary education, and particularly in postsecondary vocational/technical (voc/tech) education, has increased over the last few years as a result of several converging influences. First, there is widespread concern over the quality of education provided by all types of educational institutions. Postsecondary vocational/technical education, like all other components of education in this country, is being asked to develop measures that demonstrate the quality of the education provided. Second, there is concern about access to a quality

---

[1] For convenience, throughout this report all of these jurisdictions are referred to as states.

education for all segments of society. As the student bodies of voc/tech institutions come to have higher percentages of students who are from diverse ethnic backgrounds or are from disadvantaged backgrounds, there is concern that the education they receive be one that is likely to have returns to the individual and to society which are commensurate with the effort and cost associated with attendance. Third, with the rising cost of education, parents and students are increasingly interested in having evidence that the education they are purchasing is likely to result in program completion and employment. Finally, and most recently visible to the general public, there is the concern raised by the high rates of defaults on student loans among students attending postsecondary vocational/technical institutions compared to other kinds of institutions.

Each of these concerns results in an increasing interest in the collection of data on the outcomes of educational programs, and in efforts to disseminate information about these measures to policymakers and to potential students and their parents in the form of consumer rights information. Research and Evaluation Associates, in conjunction with the Research Triangle Institute and the University of Maryland Baltimore County, was awarded a contract by the United States Department of Education to conduct four activities that constitute initial steps in the study of these issues. The first is the development of an overview of state activities in the collection and dissemination of outcome information. The second is a series of case studies to examine more closely the process of collection of information at the state level, as well as at the institutional level.

Included will be estimates of the level of effort required, practices that threaten the reliability of the data, and exploration of institutional data collection practices independent of any state or Federal requirements. The third will be a demonstration of the feasibility of using State Wage Data information, submitted as part of each state's Unemployment Insurance System[2], as a source of unbiased outcome information for educational programs, and as a source of data that would require little effort on the part of individual educational institutions to collect. The fourth is a series of efforts designed to disseminate the findings of the overall study.

Contents of This Report

Volume I presents an overview of the study findings, including synopses of practices and major trends, as well as a summary and conclusions section. This report, Volume II, presents more detailed findings of an overview of state activities in the measurement of the outcomes of postsecondary education. The methodology used for the development of the overview is described in Chapter II. Narrative summaries of the information compiled or each state are presented in Chapter III. The key elements from the summaries are displayed in the form of a matrix in Chapter IV.

---

[2] Hereafter in this paper this will be referred to as "state wage data."

II. METHODOLOGY

Discussions with Experts

As a first step in the design of the study, project staff held discussions with persons thought to be knowledgeable about the efforts to measure the outcomes of vocational and technical education by the states or by associations of trade and technical schools. The individuals and representatives of organizations with whom discussions were held are shown in Table II-1. The individuals were asked to describe the general trends in the employment of outcome measures and other efforts related to consumer rights information. The discussions also involved the identification of specific states known by the expert to be actively involved in the outcome measurement process. The discussions concluded with a request for advice on how best to identify sources of information about the activities in each state.

Information Collection Plan

After the discussions with the national experts were completed, an information collection plan was prepared. After a review of the objectives of the overview, and based upon the information collected from the national experts and discussions among the project staff and the Contracting Officer's Technical Representative (COTR), a list of information elements was developed. The elements were chosen to represent the key descriptive information required to develop an understanding of the policies and practices of states in this area. A copy of the list is presented in Appendix A to this report.

Table II-1. National Experts and Organizations Contacted.

National Experts Contacted:	
John Lee	Consultant to the Association of Independent Colleges and Schools and the National Association of Trade and Technical Schools.
Richard Apling	Congressional Research Service
Darryl Parks	Ohio State Department of Vocational Education
Gene Bottoms	Independent Consultant
James Kadamus	New York State Department of Education
Dorothy Horell	Red Rock Community College
Gary Hoachlander and Susan Choy	National Center for Research on Vocational Education
Organizations Contacted:	
Association of Independent Colleges and Schools	
National Association of Trade and Technical Schools	
American Council on Education - Center on Education and Training for Employment	
Alliance of Independent Colleges of Art	

A variety of methods was used to complete the information table for each state. The primary activity was the review of reports, legislation, and regulations from each state. As much of the table as possible was completed from these sources. After all written materials for a state had been exhausted, the table of information was reviewed, and areas where no information was available, or where clarification was needed, were identified. Project staff then made calls to officials from the state to fill in the information gaps or to provide clarification. The information table itself was used to guide these discussions. No formal questionnaire was constructed and the questions asked of each official were tailored to match what was already known about the state and the official's relationship to postsecondary vocational education within the state. To complete the information, it was found necessary to talk not only to officials from the state departments of education, but also to representatives of the governor's office, the state legislature, the state loan guarantee agency, and to agencies responsible for the licensing and oversight of proprietary schools.

Pilot Test

To pilot test the information collection plan, senior project staff collected information from five states. Among these states were three nominated by the national experts as having active efforts to collect and disseminate performance measures, and two nominated as having little activity in this area. Literature searches were conducted to identify information describing practices in these states. This was followed by calls to state public affairs offices to obtain reports and copies of legislation and regulations. These written materials were analyzed and the results entered into the table of information elements. Information gaps and needs for clarification were identified. State officials were then contacted to provide additional information.

After the information collection process was completed, project staff developed prototype narrative summaries and an information matrix. The prototypes demonstrated that the useful information could be collected and that analytical procedures could be developed to code and summarize the information.

The results of the pilot test led to some changes in the table of information elements, particularly expanding the information on how measures were defined, when procedures were implemented, and how measures were used. The pilot test also demonstrated that one of the stiffest challenges during the full implementation of the data collection plan would be to identify which agencies within the state government are responsible for the various components of postsecondary vocational education in each state. No two states among the five states involved in the pilot test were organized in the same way. It was particularly difficult to identify the agency or agencies responsible for the oversight of proprietary schools.

Full Implementation

The full implementation of the data collection plan closely followed the activities of the pilot test. Ultimately, project staff were successful in completing the table of information elements for both public and proprietary vocational/technical education for all states but one. Only limited information from written sources was available to describe any measurement of the outcomes of vocational education in public community colleges in one state.

The difficulty in identifying the agency(ies) responsible for oversight of each component of postsecondary vocational program observed during the field test slowed the completion of the oversight. Multiple inquiries to state governments were required to develop a portrait of the organization of higher education in each state. In many states, the project staff found great compartmentalization among the agencies involved. For example, those responsible for the community college system were unable to provide information about the oversight of vocational/technical schools or of proprietary schools, or even to provide the name of an individual or agency involved in their oversight.

Limitations of the Findings

Project staff often encountered inconsistent information about the policies and practices within individual states. It was not uncommon to find written materials that were not in agreement, or to find discrepancies between the information provided over the phone by an individual and information contained in a written source that individual provided to the project. As a general rule, written sources were accepted over the oral descriptions and precedence was given to the most current written document. These inconsistencies were especially disconcerting in those instances when two individuals in the same office of the same agency gave different information. For more than one state, an initial contact would indicate that the agency did not collect outcome measures and had no plans to do so. At a later date project staff would call back to the same office for clarification of a report. A different individual in the office would mention a new initiative in the development of outcome measures that built upon a ten year history of efforts in this area.

Upon becoming aware of such inconsistencies, efforts were made to resolve them. The informant indicating that policies regarding outcome measures were in place was asked to provide copies of reports, regulations or some other materials that supported that conclusion. In reviewing the results of this interview process, the reader must be aware of the possibility that in some states where project staff made only one phone contact an uninformed worker in the agency may have been the one to indicate whether written materials were available and to answer questions.

Finally, the findings reported herein were collected primarily in the early spring of 1990. As reported, these findings often were indicated to be in a state of flux. Therefore, they are reported here to represent a snapshot of the best efforts to obtain the information at that point in time.

III. NARRATIVE SUMMARIES

A major activity of the project during this task was the development of a descriptive summary for each state. The general format includes a description of the organization of vocational education in the state, and estimates of the number of schools and students. This is followed by separate descriptions for public postsecondary vocational education, vocational technical schools (if different policies and practices apply), and proprietary institutions. For each component of postsecondary vocational education, the information assembled on the outcome measures collected, collection methods, data verification, data analysis, and uses are presented. Recently passed legislation and other indications of a change in the policies and practices are also presented. The narratives vary from state to state depending upon the organization of postsecondary vocational education in that state, the degree of activity in outcome measurement, the nature of the policies and practices in place, and the degree of similarity across the components of postsecondary vocational education. Each discussion is concluded with a section that highlights the most significant feature(s) related to the collection of outcome measures within each state.

Few of the profiles present a separate discussion for the proprietary programs for the licensed trades that are overseen solely by the licensing boards. A sample of these boards was contacted in states that had this oversight pattern, but none were found that collected outcome measures other than success on licensing exams, and none prepared reports that were used by other state agencies for policy planning or were disseminated to the general public.

Alabama

Alabama is compiling a database for public schools containing enrollment numbers, major subject areas, and student biosketches, with information on leavers and completers to be added later. No performance measures are collected by the state for proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Department of Postsecondary Education, known as the Alabama College System, has authority over 39 schools offering vocational/technical education: 20 technical colleges, 9 community colleges, and 10 junior colleges. These schools serve a total of approximately 65,000 students. The Alabama College System is overseen by the Higher Education Commission which is responsible for budget recommendations, new programs reviews, and some planning.

The Department of Education is the licensing authority for about 300 proprietary schools.

Public Schools

The Department of Postsecondary Education began compiling a database during the past six to eight months, starting with enrollment numbers, major subject areas, and student biosketches. In the future, information on leavers and completers will be added. The department plans a year's experience with collecting the data before actually using it. The Higher Education Commission is considering some assessment measures but these would only apply to the four-year university system.

Proprietary Schools

Proprietary schools must apply for a license on an annual basis. Every few years the state conducts a site visit which includes program review and facilities assessment. No measures of performance for these schools are collected by the state.

Alaska

Alaska plans to institute a campus-based outcome assessment system for postsecondary public schools funded by the state. Proprietary schools collect and report to the state their placement data by occupational area; they must provide supporting information to potential students when placement rates are used in advertising. The state is planning to institute a comprehensive statewide accountability assessment policy for nonpublic schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Alaska's 17 community colleges were recently incorporated into the University of Alaska System of Higher Education, which also contains 3 four-year universities with multiple campuses. The system is overseen by the Board of Regents. The nonpublic institutions, overseen by the Alaska Commission on Postsecondary Education, consist of one junior college and about 77 proprietary schools including vocational/ technical institutes and trade schools.

Public Schools

Alaska has no statewide assessment program for postsecondary education. However, plans are underway to institute a campus-based outcome assessment system implemented with state funding. Currently, some individual instructors wanting to keep track of their program graduates may collect completion rates, placement rates, success rates in career licensing tests, and relationship of placement to training. Completers are strictly the recipients of associate degrees. Completer data are compiled by gender and race.

The University of Alaska Statewide Institutional Research Division conducts a variety of studies on postsecondary education in the state. These studies are used as resources by the Governor and legislature in drafting appropriations legislation and for public policy decision making. One recent vocational education study investigated the reasons for a large number of the state's student loan borrowers choosing out-of-state vocational/technical education over equivalent training in the Alaska community colleges.

Proprietary Schools

The state has not required proprietary schools to submit enrollment data; the total number of students attending nonpublic schools is unknown. Placement data are collected by occupational area as part of the school annual financial report. Placement counts are based on the number of completers placed in any kind of job. Schools using placement data for advertising and other recruiting activities must submit placement rates and pertinent records by program and provide the information to potential students on request. The placement rate is calculated as the percentage of completers placed compared to the number available for placement. Excluded from these counts are completers who are not seeking work, are pregnant or in poor health, are continuing their education, or who are financial debtors to the school. Placement data are collected on a standardized form prepared by the state.

As a part of the license renewal process, site visits are conducted regularly. Institutional and program reviews are conducted every three years. New schools and new programs are reviewed every two or three years. Placement data are reviewed every two or three years during site visits with additional, immediate site visits conducted whenever false advertising is identified. On occasion proprietary schools have been shut down for license violation, such as bond expiration, student complaints, or poor financial condition.

In 1990, Alaska took steps to boost state authority over proprietary schools with priority being placed on greater school accountability. The Commission on Postsecondary Education is planning to develop a statewide accountability assessment policy for the nonpublic schools. It will take into account the various self-defined missions of participating institutions. Individual schools will use the statewide plan in developing student assessment policies relevant to their goals and objectives. Students are to be the primary beneficiaries of the quality assessment process. In addition, institutional accountability reports will be submitted annually to the Commission and made available to the public. These reports will include measures of performance such as entry, retention, and completion rates; placement rates; gains in basic and job skills; career licensing success rates; earnings levels; relationship of placement to training; employer satisfaction with graduates; student satisfaction with program; and minority recruitment, participation, and success. A formal definition of a completer is being developed. The methodology for collecting the performance measures will be determined in consultation with participating institutions. The Commission is also considering the requirement of student loan default rates for the institutional accountability report or as part of the license renewal process.

Arizona

For public schools, Arizona annually compiles its Occupational Information System (OIS) consisting of performance measures, including enrollment and completion figures, integrated with non-school provided information, such as employment and job openings, job service and unemployment insurance data, grouped by training area. The Commission for Postsecondary Education has established an ad hoc committee to develop a statewide system for assessing institutional effectiveness. The Board for Private Postsecondary Education collects data on enrollments, completers, and program offerings as part of the annual license renewal process.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Arizona has 16 public community colleges jointly overseen by the State Board of Directors for Community Colleges and the respective local districts. This Board also oversees one private community college operated by a Native American tribe. The 16 community colleges have 29 campuses organized in nine community college districts. Vocational and other programs are offered to the approximately 155,000 students attending these schools, about 82 per cent of them on a part time basis.

The State Board for Private Postsecondary Education regulates 145 nonpublic vocational/technical institutions serving approximately 106,000 students. Students in these schools are not eligible for state aid. Trade and industry schools in areas such as real estate, cosmetology, and barber training have statutory exemption from agency regulation.

All performance outcomes collected by the respective education governing boards are submitted to the Commission for Postsecondary Education. The Commission compiles the data by vocational training program and submits them to the Occupational Information System of Arizona (OIS) for analysis and dissemination. OIS is a part of the state's Occupational Information Coordinating Committee and is primarily funded by the Vocational Education Division of the state Department of Education. OIS integrates the data from various training programs with non-school provided information such as employment and job openings, job service and state wage data. The information is grouped by training area, summarized by the OIS cluster code, and published in the annual "OIS Cluster Summary Report" and several other specialized reports. The data are used in setting of training priorities and projecting placement opportunities and earnings potential.

Public Schools

The State Board for Community Colleges collects enrollment and completion figures, maintaining separate counts on minorities. A completer is the recipient of a diploma, certificate, or associate degree. Additional performance data may be collected by the community college districts but these vary across the state. The state Auditor General conducts on-site verification of enrollment data since funding is based on full-time equivalency enrollment.

The Board for Community Education collects the enrollment and completion data annually in a paper format. The information is compiled by institution and training area and submitted in an annual report to the State Auditor-General and to the State Commission on Postsecondary Education and the Occupational Information System of Arizona (OIS) for dissemination to the general public in the annual OIS

Cluster Summary Report. The Governor and legislature receive copies of the report, which they use for appropriations decisions.

The Commission for Postsecondary Education has established an ad hoc committee to develop a statewide system of assessing institutional effectiveness. The committee will conduct two sets of studies. The first group will consist of follow-up studies of community college graduates to track their placement, assess the relationship of placement to training, and document placement rates by institution and program. The second group of studies will look specifically at minority students to increase enrollment, retention, and placement of these students. One survey of minority completers will identify their initial intentions for enrolling in community college programs and whether or not their goals were met. A follow-up survey will determine their placement after completion. The ad hoc committee also is exploring the possibility of adapting Florida's performance outcomes model where data from the state Departments of Economic Security and Defense and the Internal Revenue Service would be utilized in the determination of placement rates.

In 1985 the legislature sponsored a one-time study on the status of vocational education and institutional effectiveness for consumer rights purposes. The project, the "Study of Public and Private Postsecondary Institution Vocational Education Program Completers," was administered by Northern Arizona University's Arizona Center for Vocational Education. Graduates of community colleges and vocational schools received a questionnaire that asked about placement, training-placement relationship, and earning levels. The data were summarized by institution type (public or private). The objective of the study was to enlighten the public on the quality of vocational programs available statewide. The interim report released in June 1986 met with widespread dissatisfaction, especially from the State Department of Education, which generally had opposed the study from the beginning. Criticism focused on the study methodology, such as using too many variables and the inadequacy of the completer classification system. Consequently, the interim study report was never made public and the legislature discontinued the funding for the project.

Existing legislation, "Goals for Education Excellence," mandates the three education boards--Commission on Higher Education, the Community Colleges Board, and the Board of Education (K-12)--to develop jointly a longitudinal student tracking system to monitor student progress statewide from kindergarten to the university level. However, state department of education staff indicated the law has never been implemented.

Proprietary Schools

The Board for Private Postsecondary Education collects data on enrollment, number of completers, and programs offered as part of the annual license renewal process. A completer is anyone awarded a certificate or diploma. Completion and placement rates, earnings, and other measures of performance are not required for licensure. Annual site visits are conducted in each school for product and financial audits. Student records and the condition of the facilities and equipment are routinely reviewed to assure compliance with statutory license requirements. Spot checks of submitted information also are conducted to verify the accuracy of data submissions. The greatest number of inaccuracies are found in financial documentation. However, compliance with information requirements is generally high, and schools are mostly cooperative with the review effort.

When public complaints are filed against a school, a site visit is made to conduct a program review. To conduct such investigations, regulatory provisions give the Board access to a variety of non-school data sources such as credit bureaus and other regulatory bodies with jurisdiction over participating schools.

The school-provided data are strictly for internal management decisions. However, the data are ultimately forwarded to the Occupational Information System for publication in the annual OIS Cluster Summary Report and the Arizona Proprietary Schools and Community Based Organizations Enrollments and Completers. In the latter report the information is compiled by vocational training areas, program, and county.

The Governor reportedly is committed to enhancing the quality of education obtained at vocational/technical proprietary schools. She is playing an active role in pending legislation seeking a special study to investigate the potential for the transferability of academic credit freely among public and private universities, community colleges, and vocational/technical institutes. Current procedure gives the universities the discretion over acceptance or rejection of transfer credit. Institutional negotiations are underway to identify transferable community college credits and the university core programs in which they would fit. The Governor reportedly also would like to reimplement the 1986 consumer rights follow-up study of vocational program completers.

Pending legislation for elementary and secondary education would set statewide academic goals and attempt to measure effectiveness in the work place and at higher education levels. This bill has potential impact on postsecondary vocational/technical education.

Arkansas

Using on-line data, Arkansas collects student completion and placement data as well as initial job wage rates for public vocational/technical institutions. A new system will track all students of two-year public institutions on graduation and retention rates. No data are collected from proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Department of Vocational and Technical Education oversees 24 vocational technical schools and has the authority to approve the curriculum of vocational programs at the community college level. The State Board of Higher Education oversees the two-year institutions, which consist of eight community colleges and three branch campuses of universities.

In September 1989, the proprietary schools were removed from the Department of Vocational and Technical Education and placed under a separate, newly created State Board of Private Career Education. The schools were said to endorse this new arrangement, which is expected to provide closer monitoring.

Public Schools

Vocational-Technical Schools. The state collects completion rate data from the vocational/technical schools. A completer is defined as a full-time student who finishes all program requirements. Placement rates also are collected based on the percentage of completers who are in jobs related to their training. The school superintendent of instruction decides if a match exists between a student's program and subsequent job. Initial wage rates also are collected. The Department of Vocational and Technical Education receives passage rates on career licensing tests from the respective boards.

The schools are on-line, so transfer of information to the state is rapid. A concentrated effort is made to keep enrollments and placements high. If questions about data arise, the state will contact the school, usually by telephone.

An additional source of data is the one-year follow-up survey of students who have completed programs. The survey is mailed by the Department of Vocational and Technical Education and respondents return the information directly to the Department. Questions about placement and wages are included on the survey.

Many requests for the data are made by the Governor and legislature. The schools use the data for program planning. Whole programs have been dropped and added in the last few years. Disclosure to students and the general public is made at the discretion of the schools.

The Department also audits student loan default rates. Schools must tell what they are doing to address problem areas. Information is collected on school financial condition and facilities and equipment.

Two-Year Institutions. In 1989, the legislature passed a bill that mandated the development of a tracking system for all students in state colleges and universities. This system will enable the state to calculate retention and graduation rates. The first report using this system is due in fall 1991.

The state does not collect information on placement of graduates, initial earnings, or success rates on career licensing tests from the schools.

Proprietary Schools

At the current time, no data on performance outcomes are collected from the proprietary schools.

California

The only performance measure collected for public schools in California is number of school completers. No measures of performance were collected from proprietary schools; however, the Maxine Waters School Reform and Student Protection Act of 1989 goes into effect in 1991 requiring programs of less than two years duration in these institutions to report completion, job placement, and licensure/certification rates and, if used for promotion, evidence of salary claims.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

California has 107 community colleges serving approximately 1.4 million students. Over 700,000 of them are enrolled in vocational education programs. Regional Occupational Centers are the state's equivalent of postsecondary vocational/technical institutes. They are operated by high schools but offer specialized vocational programs for adults as well.

Specialized career-oriented institutions falling under the jurisdiction of the Department of Consumer Affairs are reviewed by their respective boards; these include schools of barbering, cosmetology, acupuncture, and vocational nursing. The Private Postsecondary Education Division of the State Department of Education oversees the remaining 2,200 proprietary schools, which enroll almost 1 million vocational students.

Public Schools

Information on student completers is the only performance measure collected at this time. There are no plans presently to collect additional measures.

Proprietary Schools

At the present time, no measures of performance are collected from proprietary schools. Instead, the state relies on the judgments of all federally recognized accrediting agencies to monitor the quality of the postsecondary institutions and their programs.

The Maxine Waters School Reform and Student Protection Act of 1989, which goes into effect in January 1991, contains new requirements for proprietary postsecondary schools with programs that are two years or less in length. Schools that have been in operation for at least one year will be required to provide the following information to the state and to prospective students before they sign agreements obligating them to pay any money to an institution:

1) The completion rate for students in the course of instruction for the most recent calendar year that ended not less than 18 months prior to the date of disclosure. This rate is to be calculated by determining the percentage of students enrolled in the course of instruction who were originally scheduled, at the time of enrollment, to complete the course of instruction in that calendar year that successfully completed the course of instruction, or obtained full-time employment in the occupation or job title category for which training was offered, within 150 percent of the amount of time normally required to complete the course of instruction.

2) The job placement rate for students who were originally scheduled, at the time of enrollment, to complete the course of instruction in the most recent calendar year that ended not less than 18 months prior to the date of disclosure. In calculating this rate, the institution is to consider as not having obtained employment any graduate or other student for whom the institution does not possess evidence, documented in the student's file, showing that the graduate or other student has obtained employment in the occupation or job title category for which the course of instruction is offered.

3) If the institution or representative of the institution makes any express or implied claim about the salary that may be earned after completing a course of instruction, the school must provide the percentage of students who were originally

scheduled, at the time of enrollment, to complete the course of instruction in the most recent calendar year that ended not less than six months prior to the date of disclosure who earn salaries at or above the claimed level and the ranges of monthly salaries earned by these students in $200 increments and the number of these students in each salary range.

4) If the course of instruction leads to employment in a field requiring a state licensing examination, the school must provide the licensure or certification requirements and the pass rate of graduates on the licensure or certification examination.

To obtain placement information, schools must conduct a six-month follow up of graduates to determine which ones have obtained employment in the occupation in which they received training. The schools must obtain the name, title, or description of the job; the date the student obtained employment; and the employer's name and address.

An institution is required to discontinue offering a course of instruction if more than 40 percent of the students fail to complete it or if more than 30 percent of the completers fail to obtain employment within six months. Schools may seek to exclude specific students from the calculation of placement rate.

Colorado

Since 1989, all public postsecondary institutions in Colorado except Area Vocational Schools are required to submit annual self-accountability reports that include data on enrollment, completion, placement, relationship of placement to training, gains in basic skills and job skills, and success rates in career licensing exams, with a wide distribution of reports for consumer rights purposes. Only completion and placement rates are collected by proprietary schools, with oversight by the Department of Higher Education.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Colorado Commission on Higher Education generally oversees the state's public postsecondary education. However, the State Board for Community Colleges and Occupational Education is the day-to-day oversight agency for community colleges and postsecondary vocational/ technical schools, both public and nonpublic.

Public institutions offering postsecondary vocational programs include 15 community colleges, 2 four-year colleges with approved two-year vocational programs, and 7 area vocational schools offering programs at secondary and postsecondary levels. The Board serves approximately 69,000 students, of whom 9,000 are in area vocational schools and 60,000 in the community colleges. Four of the community colleges are organized under local districts whose boards of trustees oversee their academic track programs. Pending legislation would grant autonomy to the area vocational schools and transfer any remaining oversight responsibility to the state Department of Education.

The Board for Community Colleges and Occupational Education has oversight powers, through licensure, over the state's 58 proprietary schools that serve approximately 22,000 students.

Public Schools

Recent legislation established the higher education accountability program requiring all public postsecondary institutions except Area Vocational Schools to submit annual self-accountability reports to pertinent oversight agencies starting in October 1989. The legislation focussed on the assessment of student outcomes. Community colleges submit data on enrollment, completion, placement, relationship of placement to training, gains in basic and job skills, and success rates in career licensing exams. They also must report institutional changes made or planned as a result of the school self-assessment. The reports must incorporate a survey of students' long-term goals for attending the chosen institution. The Board maintains all the information in a central data base system, hence data are mostly submitted on computer diskettes.

Enrollment and completion data are collected on semester and annual basis respectively. The State Board is in the process of developing a standard definition of a completer and a formula for computing completion rates. Generally, the institutions define a completer as the recipient of a certificate, diploma, or associate degree. Data on completers is subdivided by gender, racial/ethnic category, and handicap.

Placement information must be obtained through a completer follow-up survey conducted during November through March after graduation. Each school develops its own survey instrument, which is administered by the vocational instructors. Respondents are asked about their currently positions, such as continuing education, employed in training-related or unrelated jobs, or unemployed. Earnings information is not a reporting requirement, but the oversight agency has access to state wage data and frequently utilizes it for institutional analyses.

Assessing gains in basic or job skills is the core of the accountability legislation. The higher education accountability process is very focussed on "value added" outcomes, requiring institutions to show evidence of skills improvement. Tests are therefore administered at entrance and exit to assess gains in both basic and job skills. Assessment instruments include the ACT and program-related exams. The individual student is the unit of analysis.

All of the institutions undergo financial and administrative audits through annual site visits. Moreover, the Board's central data base system facilitates year-round monitoring of data accuracy and compliance with reporting requirements. Although compliance with the reporting requirements was said to be good, to increase data accuracy there are tentative plans to limit institutional collection of certain types of the follow-up data (e.g., training-related placement, wage data) to only those completers the oversight agency cannot locate. Pilot studies show that two-thirds of the alumni can be located up to two years after graduation.

The data collected are mostly for institutional analysis and program evaluation. The analyses and evaluative interpretation of the information are widely disseminated through summary reports distributed to the general public for consumer rights purposes, to the Commission for Higher Education for management decisions, to the Governor and legislature for law and public policy-making, and to the business sector for placement and other needs. The reports include:

- Community Colleges Fact Book, directed to the general public.
- Annual Report, prepared under the State Vocational Act, which gives information on vocational programs available statewide, the number of completers by program, etc. for public use.
- Connections, a bimonthly newsletter designed for the private industry.
- Accountability reports from each public institution, which go to the Commission for Higher Education, the Governor and the legislature, and are available to the public on request.

New measures of performance being considered include revival of the continuance-discontinuance model of program analysis and the development of a standardized instrument to assess alumni employment satisfaction. In the former, a program is divided into quintiles and examined in detail for effectiveness and viability. The revived model would take into account any lost data, the efficiency and inefficiency issue, and other factors bearing on program feasibility. The proposed alumni study would survey vocational education completers and non-completers, and academic track continuing education students on their satisfaction with their current status. Employment satisfaction would be assessed as applicable.

Proprietary Schools

Completion and placement rates are the only measures of performance collected from proprietary schools, although the state has the capacity to collect others through the central data base system. A completer is defined as one who has passed all required courses of a program and was awarded some kind of completion document. The completion rate is the percentage ratio of the total number of completers to the total enrolled, broken down by gender and program. The placement rate is expressed as the ratio of the total number of graduates employed to the total who completed. Both measures are standardized, but not used as a condition for licensing. Consequently, no effort is made to verify accuracy of reported data.

Data are collected annually on program-specific summary forms prepared by the oversight agency. The information is used strictly for management purposes, particularly as a basis for license renewals and determination of surety bond levels. Annual site visits are made to assure compliance with licensing requirements. Several schools have been shut down for license violations, such as failure to provide the education intended, inadequate financial condition, unqualified faculty, and faulty equipment. The agency is currently in litigation with several other schools facing closure. A key defense of the schools is that the state wants to eliminate them for the stiff competition they pose to state-funded vocational/technical programs. Overall, the relationship between the oversight agency and participating schools is characterized as "businesslike," although some schools cited for noncompliance reportedly are hostile.

Newly passed legislation effective in fall of 1990 created the Colorado Private Occupational School Authority and will transfer all oversight of postsecondary proprietary schools to a specific division in the Department of Higher Education. This reorganization is expected to increase state ability to regulate these schools. Sponsored jointly by the Board for Community Colleges and Occupational Education and the Colorado Proprietary Schools Association, the legislation is also expected to make the litigation process for school closure more efficient.

In Connecticut, demographic, retention, basic skills, and career licensing data and number (but not rates) of completers and placements are collected for public community and technical colleges, with data available by gender and racial/ethnic status. Graduate surveys collect information on employments status, relation of training to employment, and value of training programs. Enrollment, completion, and basic skills data are available for the public vocational/technical schools. No uniform outcome measures are collected from proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Connecticut has 5 technical colleges that enroll about 5,000 students, all of them in vocational areas. The 12 community colleges in the state have a total of approximately 36,000 students. These schools are overseen by the Board of Trustees of Community-Technical Colleges.

The vocational technical school system consists of 17 schools, which are totally run and operated by the state. Most of the students, about 11,000, are at the secondary level. Approximately 1,000 students are post-graduates in certificate programs. An additional 5,000 students are in apprenticeship programs.

The Vocational, Technical and Adult Education Division of the Department of Education oversees the approximately 80 proprietary schools in the state. The total number of students enrolled in these schools is unknown; there is a debate about whether or not the state should gather this information.

Public Schools

Community and Technical Colleges. For community and technical college programs, individual student tracking is done at the state level. A considerable amount of demographic and retention information is maintained. Many of these data are collected at the time of registration. At some colleges, the students fill out computer cards; at other colleges, the students write out the information, which is then entered by the school into an on-line computer.

The state does not calculate completion rates but has the capability of doing so. Completion information is available; a completer is one who finishes a program of study and receives a degree or certificate. Data are available by gender and by racial/ethnic status.

It was estimated that 70 percent of the students in the technical and community colleges already are employed while attending school. The state does collect information on the number of placements but not on placement rates. The colleges send a survey to all graduates six months after graduation. The forms are returned to the colleges, which forward them to the state for analysis. The system has the capacity of providing placement information by racial/ethnic status, gender, and age but does not currently present data in this way.

The graduate survey is updated annually. In the survey of 1987-88 graduates, respondents had to select from the following categories for occupational status: full-time military, full-time employment, part-time employment, unemployed but seeking employment, and unemployed and not seeking employment. Graduates who were unemployed and not seeking employment had to explain why. If employment was not related to the training program, the graduates had to tell why. Respondents were asked if their training program helped them in obtaining a job or getting a salary increase or promotion. Graduates also rated their training programs on a number of factors.

Most students in the community and technical colleges are given the New Jersey Test of Basic Skills at two different times during their postsecondary programs. Reading, language, and mathematics are the areas assessed. Scores are reported to the state. The state also collects success rates on career licensing tests when applicable.

Twenty percent of the programs in each college are reviewed every year. The schools must conduct a self-study of each program being reviewed that includes statistical information for the three years preceding the evaluation. Among the items are number of enrollments, graduates, and placements by year, and number of graduates successfully meeting licensure/certification requirements by year. Surveys of graduate and employer reactions also are conducted. Following the self-study, an evaluation team that reflects the expertise of employers, graduates, and specialists makes a site visit to the school. The goal of an evaluation team is to compare the self-study report against the stated objectives of the program being reviewed. The report of the evaluation team is submitted to school administrators and trustees but not to the state. The state does not do a review of the student data.

An annual report on the technical and community colleges is prepared for the State Department of Education. An enrollment report and a graduate survey report also are done annually. Information from these reports is used by the postsecondary schools, secondary schools, the Governor, and the legislature. The primary use of the data is for management decisions. The reports are public documents and students have access to them at libraries but the reports are not sent to students.

Vocational Technical Schools. Enrollment and completion information is available by program in the vocational technical schools. Some programs have both secondary and postsecondary students; however, reporting is not done separately for these two groups. System-wide data are available on basic skills. Competency skills by trade also are utilized. A graduate follow-up is done only for secondary students.

Proprietary Schools

Proprietary schools apply for state approval every three years. The applications include information on size and claims toward placement. The data are not collected in any uniform way or reported as such. The application for state approval also must contain information on the curriculum, faculty, facilities, financial status, and success rates on career licensing tests.

No separate reports are done on completion or placement. Performance measures that are being considered are enrollments, completion, dropouts, and placement.

Delaware

Delaware currently does not collect performance measures for postsecondary vocational education. The Governor is receptive to establishing a state policy for outcome measures, but this is not indicated to be a priority for the legislature.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Postsecondary Education Commission in Delaware oversees one community college with four campuses, 4 private four-year colleges, and 2 public four-year colleges. Altogether, about 40,000 students attend these schools. The Private, Business and Trade Schools unit in the Department of Public Instruction oversees 30 proprietary schools.

Public Schools

Delaware has no state policy regarding outcome measures. The Division of Academic Program Review publishes the Annual Data Book on postsecondary institutions. It contains the total enrollment for each institution with breakdowns by sex and full-time/part-time students. Number of degrees awarded by field of study for the state as a whole is also presented; subdivisions by race and sex are included.

Proprietary Schools

No performance measures are collected at the state level and none are being considered. The state has few, if any, complaints about approved proprietary schools.

Annually, proprietary schools must submit application forms for state approval. The applications contain information such as school financial condition, admission and refund policies, equipment and facilities, and faculty qualifications. Representatives of the state visit all schools annually to verify the information submitted in the application approval package. Violations of approved requirements have on occasion led to program or school closure.

A directory of approved proprietary schools is published annually and made available to the general public. Schools and programs that fail the annual approval are excluded from the directory.

District of Columbia

The District of Columbia does not provide any public postsecondary vocational education and, at present, does not collect any data from proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The District of Columbia does not provide any public postsecondary vocational education. In 1989, the Education Licensure Commission was given the responsibility to oversee proprietary postsecondary schools, which include 1 vocational college and 39 nondegree postsecondary schools.

Proprietary Schools

At present no data are collected from these schools but completion and placement rates are under consideration.

Florida

Florida began the Occupational Identifier Project in 1984 to establish an effective approach to collect follow-up data on former public school vocational students. Now matching records from nine different data files, this system provides outcome data on job placement, employment earnings, outcome data on job placement, employment earnings, continued schooling, and relationship of employment to training. Established as an ongoing program in 1988, it has been expanded to include student and employer opinions. In 1989, a productivity standard was mandated based on completion rates. Requirements for proprietary schools are moving towards meeting the requirements for public schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The public postsecondary vocational/technical schools in Florida are administered at the state level by the Division of Vocational, Adult and Community Education within the Department of Education. The schools are organized in 67 districts throughout the state. The nonpublic schools are monitored at the state level by the State Board of Independent, Postsecondary, Vocational, Technical, Trade and Business Schools. The board oversees about 600 schools. Responsibility for 150 schools of cosmetology, barbering and truck driving were added at the end of 1989.

Public Schools

In recent years, significant steps have been taken to measure placement success and to tie performance on this measure to funding. In 1984, the Florida legislature initiated the Occupational Identifier Project, which sought to determine an effective approach of collecting follow-up data on former vocational students. The strategy used by the project was to conduct a computer match of individual student records with the following data bases: the state's quarterly Unemployment

Insurance Employer Wage and Tax Report (state wage data), the U.S. Department of Defense's Manpower Enlistment Files, the U.S. Government's Personnel Management Information System, the U.S. Post Office's Personnel Management System, the State Department of Administration's State Employee Files, the State University System's spring and initial fall enrollment files, and the Community College's fall enrollment files. These computer matches provided information on job placement, employment earnings, and continued schooling in Florida's public community colleges and universities. In addition to the computer match, the state Department of Education sent Florida employers of former students a brief form on which they entered the occupations and employment locations of the former students; occupation title was needed to determine the relationship of placement to training.

In 1988, the legislature required that the project be established as an ongoing program; it was renamed as the Florida Education and Training Placement Information Program. New components continue to be added to the program. In 1990, two opinion surveys were conducted. In one of them, a sample of employers known to have hired former students during the previous year was asked about the preparation of the students for employment. The second survey, sent to all Florida employers who hired licensed practical and registered nurse graduates during the previous year, focused on employer satisfaction.

In 1989, the legislature mandated a productivity standard based on completion rates, defined as the comparison of the number of students enrolling in a program and the number completing. An improvement of twenty percent must be shown each year. A task force was given one year to establish standards across the state. One factor in the development of a placement standard being considered is a result of a study being conducted by Florida State University of the reasons students drop out of vocational/ technical programs. Preliminary results indicate that the programs do not have enough exit points labeled as completions for students who enter these programs with different goals. This may change the way a program completer is defined.

Considerable attention also is given to meeting a state mandated placement standard. If a program's placement rate falls below 70 percent for three consecutive years, the program loses state funding. In earlier years, the schools designed and conducted their own surveys to provide placement information. Starting in 1989, the calculation of a placement rate for a school or program is being made using state wage data records. Whether a placement is training related is determined by comparing the industry code of the employer to the Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) codes for the student.

A report on success rates in career licensing tests also must be made to the state board and legislature. The report includes pass/fail rates per region, which are reported for 16 of the 22 licensed occupations for which arrangements have been made to track exam requests by school.

The state is working toward on-line student reporting. A common database from the Division of Community Colleges, public schools, and the Department of Labor would be developed. It would be possible with such a system to retrieve data on individual students or categories of students at any point in their careers and to assess the relationship between the educational program and subsequent employment.

The information currently reported to the state by the individual schools is presented to the state legislature. The basic organization of the report is by planning region, of which there are 28 in the state. The report also provides information by school and by program. The report for each school year is issued the following spring. These reports are based on information for the first quarter after graduation for May/June graduates. The state recognizes that this timing has the disadvantage of including many summer-only jobs as employment.

Copies of the reports are sent to school districts and to the community colleges. Disclosure to students or prospective students is not required. The uses of the information in marketing are at the discretion of the individual schools.

The rate of compliance with the requirements is currently quite high with complete information being submitted. Two years ago, six districts had their Federal funding terminated because of noncompliance, and three other districts were threatened last year. This appears to be a major motivating factor in the prompt completion of reports.

Program review is completed once every five years, and is conducted on-site by state monitoring teams. Also, teams of auditors from the Division of Administration in the Department of Education check the records against the information reported. The accuracy of the reported information has been high.

Proprietary Schools

Requirements for the proprietary schools are said to be moving toward meeting the public requirements. Currently, each year the private schools submit the number of students enrolled, withdrawals, dismissals, re-enrollments, and graduates by program. Schools also must send placement data based on a survey of a sample of students and their employers. The employers make the determination of whether the job is related to training.

The data are submitted on a standardized form prepared by the state. The information must be included in the applications for renewal, so the rate of compliance is high. The reported data are audited during on-site visits made to the schools on the average of once per year. The state also calls a sample of the students surveyed to verify the information submitted by the schools. The reported information has generally been found to be accurate.

The information on the private schools is disseminated in the form of a booklet called "Choices," which is distributed to high schools. The booklet presents the information by proprietary school and by program within school. The reported information also is reviewed by the state board, and the dropout and placement rates are examined. The board may request a placement improvement plan or a retention improvement plan, which may result in changes in or discontinuation of a program.

Georgia

Public postsecondary vocational/technical schools in Georgia collect and report completion and placement rates as well as earnings information based on initial and one-year follow-up surveys, with each related to the field of study. No performance measures are collected from proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Technical and Adult Education Department is responsible for public postsecondary vocational education in Georgia. The department oversees 32 postsecondary vocational/technical schools, which enrolled 25,658 students in FY 1989. At one time these schools were treated as an extension of the secondary system, but they were moved into a separate department during the early 1980s. With the exception of some health occupational programs, the 15 two-year colleges in Georgia are not vocationally oriented. The focus of these colleges is to prepare students for eventual transfer to the four-year colleges and universities.

The 121 licensed proprietary schools currently are overseen by the Department of Education. Legislation is pending that will place these schools under a separate commission and strengthen standards and regulations.

According to the Governor's assistant on the Council on Vocational Education, the council acts in an advisory capacity only. At present, the council is reviewing Florida's program. Most assessments in Georgia are currently conducted as self-analyses at the department level.

Public Schools

Completion rates are calculated for vocational/technical programs. Completers are defined as those who have finished a certain percentage of the program requirements (the percentage varies by program) and been placed in a related job; only full-time students are included in the calculation. Separate completion rates are calculated for women and minorities. The numbers of handicapped and disadvantaged students in the total enrollment is collected but separate completion rates are not calculated for them.

Placement rates of students in jobs related to their field of study are also calculated. The information is obtained from student surveys. The placement coordinator at each school is responsible for conducting the surveys and determining if the job is related to the field of study. Separate rates are calculated for minorities and women.

Earnings information is collected through initial and one-year follow-up surveys. Earnings are reported by major subject area.

Currently the schools provide the data to the state both quarterly and annually. A new system is being installed that will enable the state to be on-line with all schools. Reviews are done when the state has questions about the data. The review may be done by on-site visits or by telephone. The level of compliance and the accuracy of the data were said to be good.

The information is used in a statewide evaluation of training and placement effectiveness of the schools. It is also used in reports that are sent to the state advisory council, the Governor, the legislature, and the schools. The data are available in each school's placement office where it can be reviewed by students, potential students, and the general public.

Postsecondary schools use the data for planning purposes and making management decisions. Program changes are common; programs have been started, terminated, increased, and decreased as a result of the data.

Proprietary Schools

Licensing standards for proprietary schools are minimal and no measures of performance are collected from them.

Hawaii

Hawaii collects performance outcome data from public schools as part of its five-year self-study process required for accreditation. Measures, which are organized by student and program area, include completion, placement, current earnings levels, relationship of placement to training, and success rates on licensing exams (for nursing). No performance measures are collected from proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The public postsecondary schools in Hawaii consist of 2 four-year colleges and 7 community colleges administered under the University of Hawaii System. All public postsecondary vocational education is delivered through the community colleges. There are no public postsecondary vocational/technical schools. The state's seven community colleges are incorporated in the University of Hawaii system and serve an estimated 23,000 students.

The nonpublic schools include 5 four-year private colleges and 35 proprietary schools (10 vocational-technical institutes and 25 trade schools). The State Department of Education annually licenses the proprietary schools, which serve an estimated 1,046 students. By state law, proprietary students are not eligible for state financial aid. Schools in fields such as cosmetology and real estate are overseen by their respective governing boards.

Public Schools

Performance outcome information is collected from each of the seven community colleges as part of the five-year self-study process required for accreditation purposes. Outcome data are primarily used to compile required program evaluation reports. Plans are underway to enhance the program evaluation process with longitudinal follow-up studies of graduates and those who left their programs. Statewide program evaluation ended with the Perkins Act.

Performance outcome information collected includes data on completion, placement, current earnings levels, relationship of placement to training, and success rate on the nursing career licensing test. A completer is defined as either anyone awarded an associate's degree, diploma or certificate, or a partial program completer who successfully attained training-related employment. Placement data are generated through graduate and leaver surveys conducted five years after departure from school. Survey questionnaires and follow-up telephone interviews are used to identify the number of individuals placed, earnings levels, and the relationship of placement to training. The percentage employed in training-related jobs is a vital data element in the program evaluation requirement.

For each campus, information is organized by student and program or major area of study. The five-year program evaluation report is submitted in a paper format. Site visits are conducted jointly with the office of the State Director for Vocational Education to evaluate the program review process. Compliance with information requirements data accuracy rate were reported to be good. Data from the schools and other sources such as labor market data and pertinent studies are used to project the continued need for a program. At least one program a year has been shut down or initiated on the basis of this information.

The program evaluation efforts are aimed primarily at facilitating management decisions to improve program quality.

Collected information on enrollment and completion, programs offered, program reviews, etc., is disseminated in an annual evaluation report of the community colleges distributed to the State Director of Vocational Education and the general public. A summary of program evaluation and reviews goes to the President of the University of Hawaii System for use in his report to the State Board of Regents. The President's evaluative reports are often used in legislative funding decisions. Numerous other evaluation documents are produced annually for internal purposes.

The state has no pending or proposed legislation addressing the issue of consumer rights information in postsecondary education. However, the State Department of Education has entered a request in the appropriations bill seeking an increase in its operations budget to help fund data collection processes for statewide performance outcome assessment.

Proprietary Schools

The state collects no measures of performance or any outcome-related data from the proprietary schools, as these are not required for licensure. Site visits are made only to investigate filed student complaints, such as school failure to deliver instruction as advertised in a brochure or the withholding of tuition refunds. Most complaints are resolved outside litigation. School closure as a punitive measure is rare. The state publishes an annual directory of licensed proprietary schools, which is distributed widely to the public.

Idaho

The measurement of the outcomes of vocational education in Idaho is concentrated on the public schools and little attention is given to the proprietary schools. Measures collected and reported for public schools include completers, employment status, relationship of training to job placement, and initial wages. These measures are reported by school and by program

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Idaho is a small state, with few proprietary schools and only six state supported postsecondary schools.

Public Schools

For the six state supported postsecondary schools in Idaho, the number of completers is collected five times per year, corresponding with school "sessions." A follow-up of program completers is done once each year through a mail survey of all students completing their programs between July 1 of the previous year and June 30 of the current year. The survey is conducted in the fall of each year so that completers have been out of school for at least three months.

The major components of the survey are whether the completer is employed, a self-report on whether the skills learned in vocational training are being used in their current position, and initial wages. Students who do not respond to the mail survey receive a follow-up telephone call.

The surveys are conducted by the individual schools and must be submitted to the state Division of Vocational Education by January 1. The information is provided to the state by program within an individual school. The state provides the forms for reporting the data on completers and the follow-up information to the schools. Data are reported by school and by program.

The only check on the quality of the data occurs during on-site evaluations conducted by state staff every five years for accreditation renewal. The data reporting system is also informally checked during regular deans' meetings and contact between school staff and state staff. There has been no effort to use third party data, such as state wage data, to verify or supplement the information reported by the schools.

There are plans to move toward collecting limited information from all enrollees, whether they complete the program or not, on an annual basis. Additional information from a sample of students would be collected for special studies. A study of lifetime earnings has been discussed as a topic for one of the special studies.

The State Board publishes a catalogue that outlines all higher education programs in the state. In addition to a narrative report prepared by the Division of Vocational Education, the number of enrollees and number of completers are included for all programs, and placement rates for some programs are included. The report is provided to the schools and to the general public. Information on initial wages is reported to the schools, and they are free to use or disclose the information as they wish.

Some career planning and placement offices in the schools make extensive use of this information in advising students. The state funds one of these offices in each postsecondary vocational school.

As the result of follow-up data collection, schools have closed out programs, reallocated money among programs, increased recruitment efforts, developed alternative delivery methods, and restructured the curriculum.

Some schools add additional items to the survey or conduct their own data collection efforts. The schools monitor gains in basic skills, using an "Asset Test" developed by the state, but do not report the results to the state. Individual schools also collect information on success rates in career licensing tests, loan default rates, and the reasons students drop out of the programs. None of this information is reported to the state.

The state expects to be doing a study of postsecondary vocational education in the near future. It will be a modification of a study on secondary vocational education that was completed recently.

Proprietary Schools

There are currently few proprietary schools in the state, although some are beginning to move in from other states. At the current time, there is no follow-up study of program completers required and no data are collected from these schools at the state level.

Illinois

Each August 1, community college systems in Illinois submit data by race and sex on students who were completers in the previous school year. Each year, 20 percent of the programs conduct an occupational follow-up study and report on program-related placement, job and program satisfaction, and hourly salaries. Work has just begun on an employment tracking system using Employment Security files matched with student Social Security Numbers. Under new requirements, proprietary schools must submit student enrollment agreements that include program information, cost, completion rates, and placement data--the latter only when used in advertising. Schools are subject to probation and license revocation if their completion rate falls below 50 percent.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Illinois Community Colleges Board oversees 50 schools. Of the 661,000 students enrolled in credit courses in these schools, 263,000 are in vocational courses. The Nonpublic School Approval Section of the Department of Recognition and Supervision under the Board of Education oversees the 210 proprietary schools that have programs for which licensure is not needed for practicing the trade, with an estimated 50,000 students attending these schools. Programs leading to a state license are the responsibility of the relevant licensing boards.

Public Schools

The community colleges implemented a new evaluation system in 1989-90. Under this unit record system, the colleges provide the state with substantial data on each student enrolled. Completion information is also entered into the system; on August 1, schools submit the data on students who had completed in the previous school year. A completer is one who has met all the requirements of an approved curriculum and received a certificate or degree. Completion data are available by sex and racial/ethnic status. Completion rates are not yet used, but the state is considering developing a formula as the result of the Perkins requirements.

Each year an occupational follow-up study is conducted on 20 percent of the programs. The five-year schedule has been planned so that no college has a heavy load several years in a row. Items on the survey of completers include current educational status and present employment. Respondents must indicate if their jobs are related to their college program and if the jobs are not related to give the reason why. Other survey items are the number hours worked each week, present hourly salary before deductions, job satisfaction, satisfaction with the program of study, name of the employer, job title, and job duties.

Occupational follow-up surveys are done by the individual colleges in March of the year following completion. All questions provided by the state must be included but the colleges may add questions. The survey may be done by mail or over the telephone. Colleges enter the information into a computer and send the data to the state. The state does the analysis of the data but the colleges might also analyze the data.

Schools also must conduct an employer survey. They may do this by mail but the state recommends that they either conduct in-depth interviews of a sample of employers or assemble focus groups of employers for discussion sessions. Employer follow up is begun as soon as student information is received and must be submitted by August 1.

All schools comply in submitting data on individual students. Some individual data items are sometimes missing, most frequently the racial/ethnic status and the county code of residence. These items are missing because the students do not supply the information. According to one source, because the data are on a unit record basis, the schools are less likely to submit inaccurate information.

To receive state funding, a college must be recognized by the Illinois Community Colleges Board. As a part of the recognition process, the colleges must do a self-study every three years and the state must make an on-site visit. One of the standards in this process is that the school must submit accurate data in a timely manner.

Each college will receive a summary report on its follow-up data as well as a state summary. Uses of the data have yet to be determined. In the past it has been submitted to the Board and to the community colleges. On request, it has been provided to the legislature and the Governor's subcabinet. It is expected that information about individual programs would be provided by the local colleges. A statewide task force is looking into disclosure so that colleges will handle it consistently.

In the past, data collection was done primarily to make management decisions. With the new disclosure requirements, about equal weight will be placed on consumer rights purposes and management decisions. The decision to discontinue or restructure a program is made by the individual colleges. The state does not have the authority to do this, although the Board of Higher Education can make a recommendation to a local board of trustees that a program is not viable.

The Community Colleges Board has just begun to work with the Department of Employment Security on an employment tracking system. The social security numbers of completers are being checked against Employment Security files to determine if the individuals are 1) registered with the job service, 2) drawing unemployment, 3) employed, 4) place of employment, and 5) quarterly earnings. One problem with using these data is that they do not indicate occupation, just the location of employment.

The Community Colleges System is considering having students sign a declaration of intent that includes the program in which they are enrolled. This would simplify the task of assigning the student to the correct program, which has been a problem in the past. Students also would indicate when they expect to complete, which would be useful in disclosing data to the public. For example, some students never had the intention of completing a full course of study; they just wanted to take two welding courses. How this type of student is counted could have a major effect on the calculation of a completion rate.

Proprietary Schools

In January 1989, Illinois revised its statute pertaining to proprietary vocational education. The rules are expected to be ready in April or May 1990. It is recognized that the statute needs some technical corrections.

Under the new requirements, schools must submit each student's enrollment agreement to the state. Among the items that must be contained in each of these agreements are the name and description of the student's course of instruction, the total cost of the course of instruction and all other services, a buyer's right to cancel, and most of the disclosure information described below.

Schools must provide the number of students who enrolled in the school during the school's last fiscal year and the number and percentage who did not complete the course of instruction. Completion rates also will be calculated by comparing the number of students enrolled in the year in which they expect to complete to the number who actually do finish. A completer is one who has graduated or completed a program. If a school's completion rate drops below 50 percent of the industry average within the state, the school will be put on probation for one year. If the completion rate is below 50 percent for a second year, the school's approval to operate in the state will be revoked.

Under the current requirements, schools must provide placement rates to the state only if they advertise that they have a placement and assistance program. Then, they must provide the number of completers who sought assistance from the placement service and the number who were placed. Any kind of placement counts. Under the new requirements schools will report placement rates for completers who used the placement assistance and for those who did not use the assistance. Initial wage rates will be reported if the schools have the data after making reasonable efforts to contact completers by mail.

Schools will report their data in their renewal applications that are due April 1. These data, however, will be based on each individual school's fiscal year. The data will be monitored during the on-site audits that the state already makes at least twice a year to each school. During these audits, faculty qualifications, facilities and equipment, and school financial condition are reviewed.

Individual schools already are required to give the number of students enrolled in a program, the number completing, and the number placed to new students at the time of enrollment. It is reported that less than perfect data are being submitted currently.

Indiana

Currently, public schools in Indiana report student information on course enrollment, credit hours completed, and major; student retention and completion data could be computed on these data. A performance measurement system is under development. Proprietary schools provide enrollment, dropout, and graduation information to the state. The state calculates completion rates and obtains placement rates through a survey of a sample of employers. The state also collects information for annual accreditation renewals.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Commission on Higher Education oversees postsecondary vocational education in Indiana. The Indiana Commission on Vocational and Technical Education has some overlapping oversight responsibilities. The majority of the programs are located at Indiana Vocational Technical College. Other programs are provided at a second two-year technical institution and at five of the four-year institutions. In addition, both secondary and postsecondary programs are provided in the state's 27 vocational technical training centers. The state does not have a community college system.

The Commission for Postsecondary Proprietary Education oversees all proprietary schools except those regulated by other state agencies, such as cosmetology and barbering colleges and real estate institutes. Over 200 schools are regulated by the commission and they enroll about 30,000 students.

Public Schools

In 1987, the General Assembly reorganized vocational and technical education. The Commission on Higher Education is in the process of developing a performance measurement system for these programs.

Currently, the state has a student information system that contains data such as course enrollment, credit hours completed, and major. Schools submit this information on computer tape in a standardized format. Student retention and completion can be determined from these data. The Commission on Higher Education submits a list of programs with low enrollments and few graduates to the respective institutions to have them either justify the value of these programs or shut them down. Five occupationally specific programs have been eliminated under this process.

In 1987, the General Assembly also ordered the Commission on Higher Education to conduct an attrition-persistence study. The Commission's study tracked all students who entered in 1984-85 and declared from the beginning that they were seeking a degree. These students were followed over a five-year period. Data were obtained from the student information system. It is expected that similar groups of students will be tracked in the future.

In summer 1989, Phi Delta Kappa conducted a study to formulate a list of criteria for evaluating vocational technical education programs. A state panel has been established to review and select appropriate criteria that would serve as useful measures in evaluating programs. No follow up of graduates is being done currently.

Proprietary Schools

To be accredited in Indiana, proprietary schools must be reviewed by the State in the areas of financial stability, admissions standards, enrollment forms or contracts, program content, instructor qualifications, student record keeping, and refund policies.

Institutions must be bonded and their recruiting agents licensed. During an on-site visit, the school's programs and physical facilities are evaluated. Proprietary schools provide enrollment, dropout, and graduation information to the state. Completion rates are calculated based on a comparison of the number of completers to the number who started the program. A completer is one who has finished a program. Both full-time and part-time students are included in the calculation; most students are enrolled full time.

Placement rates also are collected by the state through a survey of a sample of employers. The employers are asked to assess whether the placement is related to the training. Separate rates are calculated for graduates who are working in their field of study and those who are not. Initial wage rates are not collected by the state. However, in the graduate records of students, the schools must retain: 1) job placement given if job placement assistance is offered by the institution and 2) place of employment and job salary after graduation.

Schools submit data annually in the accreditation renewal and a report to the state, but the Commission does not prepare a report on the information. The data are primarily used for management decisions. The state audits a random sample of 10 percent of the completion and placement rates for each school.

Iowa

In Iowa, community colleges conduct a "vital signs" self-evaluation every five years that includes such information as completion and placement rates; student perceptions of vocational training; employer satisfaction of students' technical knowledge, work attitude, work quality, and comparison to others similarly employed; and per student costs. A criteria checklist collects information about programs, funding, staffing, facilities, etc. The state presently does not collect any outcome data from proprietary schools, but is considering some measures.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Bureau of Area Colleges in the Department of Education oversees 14 community colleges and 1 vocational/technical institute, enrolling about 500,000 students. The Vocational Education Advisory Council oversees vocational education programs in the community colleges and the 435 secondary school districts. About 375 of the secondary districts offer vocational education at the postsecondary level. Altogether, the Vocational Education Advisory Council oversees about 8,000 postsecondary vocational education students. Two proprietary business schools are members of the Postsecondary Coordinating Council and also of the Iowa Association of Independent Colleges.

Recent legislation has established strict vocational education standards that become effective July 1, 1992. All postsecondary education will use competency based instruction, articulation with postsecondary instruction, and minimum competencies in six areas--leadership skills; entrepreneurial skills; job seeking, job keeping, and adaptability skills; knowledge of emerging technology; strengthening of basic skills; and employment skills relating to industry training standards. The Board of Education was charged with the responsibility of establishing minimum competency levels in all these areas. About 25 committees will be set up to investigate attainable minimum competency levels that also will become accreditation standards for local schools and community colleges. Proprietary schools will be exempted from the vocational education standards but it is possible that the system will be incorporated into the approval process of these schools.

Pending legislation proposes the establishment of a 14-member higher education strategic planning council with statutory powers over all higher education.

The Iowa College Aid Commission is the official loan guarantee agency for the state. The Commission requires schools with high loan default rates to provide placement rates and initial salaries. Schools must also identify steps taken in minimize loan losses.

Public Schools

Currently, the official student outcomes program for community colleges in Iowa has two components: a "vital signs" analysis and a criteria checklist. The vital signs analysis is a self-evaluation system in which schools must provide data by program on factors such as completion rates, placement rates, student perception of vocational training, employer satisfaction, and per student cost. Earnings data are provided on a voluntary basis. The individual schools determine how to calculate completion rates. Placement rates are defined as the comparison between the number of completers employed and the number available for work. Schools survey employers for their satisfaction with the job performance of graduates in the areas of technical knowledge, work attitude, and work quality. They also are asked to compare the graduates to others who are employed in similar positions.

For the criteria checklist, schools must provide documentation on program offerings, program evaluation, instructor load, funding, staffing, and facilities and equipment.

Schools submit the information for the self-analyses to the state every five years, but some schools collect the information annually for internal use. Teams of people from the state then visit the schools and prepare a report on each school. Schools must submit progress reports for the subsequent years.

Proprietary Schools

The Postsecondary Coordinating Council does not require member institutions to submit any outcomes assessments. Data on completion and placement are reported to the Federal government as part of the annual financial aid audit, but state agencies take no role in this. The state is considering requiring the proprietary schools to submit graduation and placement rates.

Kansas

Public postsecondary vocational schools in Kansas report information on number of completers and placement rate by gender and race, with a required 70 percent placement rate for students within two years after graduation. Social Security Numbers are used to track students whose placement status is "unknown." Average annual earning, job satisfaction, success rates on licensing tests, basic skills test scores, and employer ratings of employee job skills are reported. No performance measures are collected from proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Community and Vocational Education Division of the Department of Education oversees 14 approved vocational/technical schools and 19 community colleges. The vocational/technical schools enroll about 42,000 students; approximately 100,000 students attend the community colleges and business/industry short-term programs, such as seminars and one-month courses. The division also licenses proprietary schools on an annual basis. The state has about 73 proprietary schools; with the rapid turnover among these schools, the total count changes monthly.

Public Schools

The state collects information on the number of completers in each instructional program. A completer is defined as one who has been awarded a degree, diploma, or certificate or has finished all courses in an approved program. Completion information is available by gender and racial/ethnic categories.

The number of completers placed and the placement rate of completers are collected by the schools through a survey and reported to the state. Six categories of placements are used in the survey: unrelated placement, related placement, military service, continuing education, unemployed, and status unknown. The last two categories, unemployed and status unknown, are excluded from the calculation of placement rate. Schools are required to have a 70 percent placement rate during the first two years after completion. Schools must explain low rates and may lose approval for programs with low placement rates. Follow up on students is done three months after initial placement. A second follow up is done three months after that, i.e., six months after initial placement.

Schools submit the social security numbers (SSN) of program completers to the state Education Department. When a student's placement status is reported as "status unknown," the SSNs are cross-referenced with state wage. Completers who are found not to be employed receive state placement help.

The schools conduct a survey of completers one year after leaving the schools. A survey of employers also is conducted. The schools then report average annual earnings, job satisfaction, success rates on career licensing tests, and basic skills test scores to the State Education Department. Employer ratings of employees' job skills are also assessed.

Schools are required to submit enrollment and placement data at the end of the calendar year. By February 15 of the following year, schools must submit a placement report. The Department compiles this information into two reports: the Annual Vocational Education Accountability Report, which goes to the legislature, and a report on placement rates and average salaries. The information is used for botn management decision-making and consumer rights purposes. Press announcements frequently are made.

Schools are site visited every year. Every five years, the state conducts a product audit that involves both a financial audit and a visit by an accreditation team. Areas funded with public funds are expected to show program improvement.

Gains in basic skills also are assessed for each program. Tests are administered at program entry and completion. Students are assigned to remedial programs when appropriate.

Proprietary Schools

The state does not collect any performance measures from the proprietary schools. Only the number of enrollees by program are submitted. Instead, the state uses the standards established by the pertinent accreditation agency. For real estate schools that are unaccredited, the agency sends the curriculum to the Kansas Real Estate Commission for evaluation of performance standards.

The Department tried to compile data on all currently enrolled students in proprietary schools. The high turnover made the task impossible. Only a few schools responded to the questionnaire over a six-month period.

The legislature has mandated that an occupational handbook be prepared using completion and placement information from postsecondary schools. Proprietary schools have been invited to participate.

Kentucky

Vocational/technical schools in Kentucky report on school conditions data (e.g., finances, facilities, enrollment trends), completion rates, placement one year after leaving school (through survey results), and, if placed, employer survey data. There is no systematic collection of performance data by the state from either community colleges or proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Kentucky has 22 vocational/technical schools; 5 are health related and the remaining 17 are state vocational/technical schools. Some secondary students attend 14 of the state vocational/technical schools. Altogether the vocational/technical schools enroll about 11,000 students. The Higher Education Council oversees 21 community colleges, 7 of which are on the campuses of four-year institutions. About 36,000 students attend the community colleges. The Education and the Humanities Cabinet oversees 92 proprietary schools, which enroll about 28,000 students.

Public Schools

Completion rates are collected from the vocational/technical schools. A completer is a person who has the competencies to complete a predetermined occupational code title from the Dictionary of Occupational Title Codes (DOT). Each program may have several exit points below the diploma level.

Placement information is collected in a student survey conducted by the school instructors one year after the student has left the school. Placement categories include employment in jobs related to training, employment in jobs unrelated to training, continuing education, and not available for work. The relationship between placement and training is determined by the teacher conducting the survey. At one time, the student survey contained questions about earnings, but these have been deleted.

For students who are employed in jobs related to their training, an employer survey is done by the schools one year after the student is on the job. Earnings information was asked in 1989, but many employers would not complete the survey because they did not want wage information known. In 1990, the survey of employers asked about average wage data in different occupational areas. This also produced a low response rate and is not expected to be asked again.

Success rates on career licensing tests are reported to the state. Students must pass an exit test of Adult Basic Education in the areas of language arts and computation. However, scores on this test are not sent to the state.

Schools report the data quarterly on a computerized, on-line system. Each year, one-third of the schools participate in a formal, program-by-program evaluation and validation.

State wage data are used to develop labor force projections for program development. The difficulty with these data is that they show a statewide picture while the state prefers to look at local markets. The state also has information on school financial condition, facilities and equipment, and student enrollment trends.

The data are used to make programmatic decisions, such as modifying or phasing out programs. The Governor and legislature are provided information on request. The postsecondary schools receive information on the program evaluation and modifications. No effort is made to provide information to students and their families.

At present, no systematic collection of assessment information exists for the community colleges, but the Higher Education Council is pushing for this type of requirement. The legislature is considering funding for assessment.

Proprietary Schools

The proprietary schools in Kentucky currently operate under minimal licensing standards; no measures of performance are collected by the state. Legislation has been introduced that would require placement and graduation rate data to be disclosed to all students before they are enrolled.

Louisiana

Louisiana currently collects completion and placement data from each program in the vocational/technical schools. A ratio of completers to leavers must be provided. Placement data are collected through a survey of completers that also collects information on relatedness of job to training. A follow-up survey of employers collects information about students' technical knowledge, work attitudes and abilities, and adequacy of vocational training. No performance measures are collected from proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Louisiana does not have community colleges. The Office of Vocational Education in the Department of Education is responsible for 45 postsecondary vocational/technical schools. The Division of Proprietary Schools in the Department of Education oversees the 225 proprietary schools with programs in areas that do not require a license. Schools for cosmetology, barbering, real estate, and other fields requiring a license are under their respective boards.

Public Schools

Louisiana is in the process of finalizing a Vocational Technical Information Network that will ultimately automate postsecondary vocational education follow-up activities.

Currently, completion and placement data are collected from each program in the vocational/technical schools. A completer is defined as any student who finishes a planned sequence of courses or activities designed to meet a vocational occupational objective that teaches entry-level job skills. The individual must meet all the requirements of the school for program completion whether or not the person graduates. A ratio of completers to leavers must be provided.

Placement data are collected through a survey of completers conducted by the school. The survey is used to determine the number of completers who are employed in jobs related to training, employed in jobs not related to training, employed full time in the military, continuing their education, not employed but looking for work, and not attending school. Employer follow-up data also are collected by the State. Employers of those who are working in a field related to their training are asked if the individuals had technical knowledge related to the job, a desirable work attitude, an ability to produce quality work, and more than adequate overall vocational training. Employers also are asked to compare the vocational training of both completers and leavers to employees who did not participate in a vocational program.

Summaries of the follow-up reports from the schools are published in an Annual Executive Summary. The State is in the process of establishing an automated Vocational Technical Information Network that also will automate the completer/leaver/employer follow-up activities.

Proprietary Schools

No performance measures are collected from the proprietary schools and no reports are generated. The state does regulate advertising from these schools, requiring substantiation of claims made for placement and earnings.

Maine

Maine collects completion and placement data from its six technical colleges, although common definitions are not used. A graduate mail survey collects employment satisfaction and initial wage rates. The state also collects some school characteristic data. Proprietary schools submit the data needed to complete IPEDS forms.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Maine Technical College System consists of 6 two-year technical colleges that enroll 3,000 full-time students and 6,000 part-time students. Maine has 4 proprietary postsecondary schools and 13 nonprofit private schools. The state has no direct oversight over private schools.

Public Schools

Completion rates based on the number of students starting compared to the number of completers are collected. Completers are those students who have satisfactorily completed a program, certificate, or degree. The calculation procedure is not standardized across the state.

Placement information also is collected by the State, but each school uses its own definition of the data categories. Data are collected on the number of students employed in jobs related to their education, the number in unrelated jobs, and the number continuing on to four-year schools. Employment satisfaction and initial wage rates also are collected. This information is obtained through a mail survey of all graduates; those who do not respond are contacted by telephone. In some years, a survey is made of all employers mentioned on the graduate follow ups. Some schools conduct five-year follow-up surveys of their graduates. Career licensing tests success rates are collected when applicable.

The completion and graduate follow-up data are collected annually. They are included in a report that is given to the Board of Trustees, the Governor, and the legislature. All academic and management divisions of the schools receive the information and conduct their own analyses. Students are informed of placement rates. The information is used primarily for management decisions. Program evaluations are based on placements.

The state also collects information on school financial condition, student enrollment trends, and facilities and equipment.

Proprietary Schools

The private schools return Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS) forms to the state, which makes copies of them. From these data, the state compiles summary statistics for its own use. The state does not collect any additional data from the private schools.

All community colleges in Maryland annually report enrollments, number of completers, and number of placements by sex and race. Biannual follow-up studies of completers are used to gather information to determine completion rates, placement rates, earnings information, and relationship of placement to training. An employee satisfaction survey obtains information on training program quality and relationship of placement to training. Plans are in process to use unemployment insurance wage data as a performance outcome measure. Proprietary schools submit information on enrollees, dropouts, completers, and placements. Completion and placement rates are reported by gender, race, and program.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Maryland's postsecondary education schools are overseen by the state Higher Education Commission. Vocational programs fall under two categories: the collegiate (public) and noncollegiate (nonpublic vocational/technical institutes). The collegiate programs are contained in 19 community colleges and the noncollegiate programs operate in 175 proprietary schools. About 100,000 students are enrolled in the community colleges and about 60,000 students attend the proprietary vocational schools.

Public Schools

All community colleges report performance outcomes including completion rates, placement rates, and earnings information annually at the request of the Higher Education Commission and the Board of Community Colleges. Success rates in career licensing tests are also collected from some of the licensing agencies.

The schools also report on initial part-time and full-time enrollment, number of completers, and number of individuals placed by sex and race to the Higher Education Commission. Completion rates are calculated for both full-time and part-time students, taking into account those who dropped out of programs or are on vacation or leave of absence. However, the Commission has found that most community college students are not seeking the associate degree so completion rates are mostly insignificant. Placement rates, on the other hand, receive serious attention and determine survival or initiation of a program. Only those placed in training-related jobs are included in the calculation. Several programs in community colleges have been terminated for low placement. No site visits are made to participating schools. The information collected is disseminated in the Commission's Annual Report, which is available to participating schools, policymakers, and the general public.

The State Board of Community Colleges conducts biannual follow-up studies of completers to determine their education outcomes four years after graduation. During this time, the Board compiles information on completion and placement rates, relationship of placement to training, success rates in career licensing tests, and current annual earnings. In between the biannual follow-up studies, the Board has conducted mini-surveys of nonreturning students, and attempted to follow up on all entrants. Data generated are used to advise the community colleges.

Completion rate, computed on a program basis, is the ratio of the total number of completers to the program's first time/full-time enrollees at four years prior to current follow-up study. Completers must be recipients of the associate degree or certificate. Enrollment data are collected from the colleges every fall semester and completion data at the end of the fiscal year. Computed completion rates are calculated for each community college. The Board uses completion rates for program evaluation.

To measure placement rates, survey questionnaires are mailed to all graduates one year after completion by the schools. The survey instruments are developed by the Commission on Higher Education, and the data are summarized and transmitted to the Commission on a standardized form. Respondents are asked, among other things, whether they are employed full-time or part-time, current annual salaries, and whether or not their jobs are related to training. A graduate must be a full-time employee in a training-related capacity to be considered placed. Therefore, the placement rate is the percentage ratio of the total number placed in full-time, training-related jobs to the total number of respondents for that survey period. Separate rates are shown by the programs within a college. The employer satisfaction survey, conducted only with student's consent, is used to determine relationship of placement to training. Employers are asked on an evaluation questionnaire to rate program quality based on the completer's job performance. Gains in basic skills are not collected at the state level although individual colleges administer their own competency-based tests at entrance and exit. The Board, however, collects first time passing rates in some career licensing exams such as nursing and allied health. Plans are underway to give the Board access to the state wage data for use in the analyses of performance outcomes.

The school-provided data are used to identify weak programs through the Board's annual evaluation system. After each follow-up study, the Board compiles a program profile for each program offered in the colleges. Three weak programs per college are analyzed in detail; they are targeted on the basis declining enrollment, sharp cost increases per credit hour, and completer dissatisfaction. Faculty is then asked to do a self-study of the identified weak programs.

Plans are underway for colleges to begin using performance indicators. Colleges will be required to submit an assessment procedure, provide mission statements, and establish accountability programs.

The Board makes annual site visits to conduct a product audit as part of the institutional approval process. The team primarily verifies the follow-up survey data, for instance, the date the student entered the program, whether or not student completed necessary courses, and the program listed as the student's major. Independent CPA auditors verify enrollment data. On the whole the Board has good working relations with the colleges. The data collection efforts have resulted in some major Board decisions as well as policy initiatives. Included among them were:

- Discontinuation of 104 programs in the last 12 years due to enrollment decline or low placement. Colleges seeking to reinstate discontinued programs must demonstrate proof that employment exists for all potential graduates, e.g., mental health assistants.
- A follow-up study of nursing graduates during the recent nurse shortage that showed that the majority of those trained in community colleges were employed in full-time nursing. This resulted in the legislature authorizing additional funding for nursing programs in the community colleges.

- A follow-up study of the continuing education population that found that most were working in areas related to the course work they were taking. This outcome also generated increased funding for community college programs.

Information gathered is widely disseminated through numerous reports distributed to participating institutions, boards of trustees, the Governor and the legislature, and the general public. The reports include:

- Annual Report of programs identified as weak and needing a self-study.
- An Annual Performance Profile Report on the colleges, sent to their local boards of trustees.
- Methodological reports explaining each survey; the colleges have used follow-up survey reports for recruiting purposes.
- Informal analysis reports, sent back to the colleges with encouragement that the information be shared with local communities and boards of trustees.
- Other specialized reports and analyses compiled for various state agencies and published bulletins.

Proprietary Schools

Annually, proprietary schools submit data by program on the total number of enrollees, dropouts, those on vacation or leave of absence, completers, and placements. A completer is defined as one awarded a diploma or certificate. Completion rate, expressed as the percentage ratio of total completers to the total initially enrolled, is calculated separately for full-time and part-time students in each program, and is broken down by gender and race. Placement must be training-related to be included in the calculation of placement rates. Placement rate, expressed as the ratio of those placed in training-related jobs to the number of completers, is calculated by program within a school, and is broken down by gender and race. The schools determine the relationship of placement to training. Data are collected on a standardized form designed by the Higher Education Commission.

Each school receives an annual site visit during which reported data are audited and overall institutional operation reviewed. Labor market conditions play a major role in curricula development. Several programs have been terminated or initiated according to prevailing or projected labor market needs.

The information collected is disseminated in the Commission's Annual Report, distributed widely to participating schools and the general public.

Students in proprietary schools are eligible for some of the state financial aid. In addition, students attending nationally accredited proprietary schools may receive legislated scholarships, and are also counted among the state's 32,507 current recipients of student loans under the Stafford (and other) loan programs. The Maryland Higher Education Corporation serves as the official student loan guarantee agency. The state's current default rate is around 10 percent, a quarter of which is attributed to proprietary students.

Massachusetts

The state collects basic skills data and number of degrees conferred for community college students in Massachusetts. It recently conducted a survey to determine what measures of effectiveness are being used. Every two years, proprietary schools submit a licensing application form that includes number of graduates and placements. State law prohibits the collection of earnings information.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

In Massachusetts, the Board of Regents of Higher Education collects information on the 15 community colleges, which enroll approximately 73,000 students. The Department of Education licenses the state's 140 proprietary schools and oversees regional vocational schools at the secondary level.

Public Schools

The state collects information on the number of degrees conferred rather than completion rates. The community colleges submit the data in written form on an annual basis, but they are not required to provide it. The state uses the information primarily for management decisions; the data are not included in a report.

Most of the community colleges collect some follow-up data on their students. This information is not sent to the state. IPEDS data are the only source of placement data used at the state level.

Massachusetts will begin to collect gains in basic skills at the state level in September 1990; the details are still being worked out. The state is also starting to collect data on school enrollment trends and school financial condition.

The state recently conducted a survey of the community colleges to determine what measures of effectiveness are being used. The survey contained items on measures such as degrees conferred and follow-up information. The data have not been compiled. The information will be used internally and not released to the public.

Proprietary Schools

Every two years, proprietary schools must submit a licensing application form to the state. Some performance measures are included in the form. The number of graduates is collected; both full-time and part-time students are included in the count. The number of students placed is also collected.

The State Department of Education is prohibited by state law from collecting earnings information.

The applications are evaluated for licensing purposes only; no other use is made of the information. The state is currently reviewing the legislation in this area. It expects to be looking at completion and placement issues.

Michigan

Michigan collects information on enrollments and number of completers from its community colleges. There has been resistance to collection of additional performance data. Each spring, the state collects enrollment and graduation data from the proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Michigan has 29 public junior and community colleges, which are attended by 224,000 full-time and part-time students. About 110,000 students attend the state's 55 vocational centers but only about 4,000 to 5,000 of the students are adults. The Higher Education Management Service Area oversees 310 proprietary schools.

Public Schools

The Department of Education collects information on enrollment and the number of completers from the community colleges. A completer is someone who has completed a certificate or degree; both part-time and full-time students are included in the count. Total enrollments for each school are subdivided by gender and racial/ethnic status. It is up to the individual schools to decide if they will collect placement rates. The colleges collect some initial earnings information but the rate of return of the information is low.

The Department of Education has tried to move toward the Florida approach for collecting performance data but it was unable to get an agreement from the community colleges. No legislation exists to require this approach and the colleges successfully lobbied legislators to prevent such a system from being mandated.

Colleges submit the enrollment and completion data to the state on computer disks and the information is uploaded into the state's on-line database. A separate unit, the Community Colleges Services Unit, handles compliance and accuracy of the information received from the schools.

An annual report is sent to the Governor and the legislature. Special topic reports also are produced. Postsecondary schools have access to the on-line data. The data are used primarily for management decisions, which tend to focus on fiscal matters.

Information is given to students and their families on request. Most requests concern tuition rates. The Michigan State Placement Institute provides aggregated information by program, not by institution; the emphases of this information are career choices and cost-benefit analysis.

Although programs at the vocational centers are primarily for secondary students, a small number of adults also participate. The adult population is composed of students completing their general equivalency diplomas (GEDs) and high school graduates taking occupationally specific programs. Participation data are collected for these programs but the information is not reported separately for adults and secondary students.

Proprietary Schools

Every spring the state conducts a program inventory of proprietary schools. The state sends the schools a computer form that the schools must update. The schools must indicate enrollment and the number of graduates from the prior school year. In the past, schools have reported student numbers that differ from the data submitted to IPEDS. It is thought that some schools are not counting students correctly. Consequently, the state is putting more attention on accurate student counts this year. Schools are requested to provide completion information by racial/ethnic status but some do not.

Some schools have placement information but they are not required to provide it to the state. Accredited schools are often required to conduct follow ups of their graduates as a part of the accreditation process. The legislature has been working on a bill that may require placement and earnings information.

The state analyzes the enrollment and completion data but does not produce a report on it. The Board of Education is the only user of the data. To date, no major changes in policies or programs have occurred as a result of the data. To remove the license from a school would take something dramatic; an enrollment drop would not provide just cause.

During on-site reviews, the completion data are examined. Other factors that are reviewed are student complaints and facilities and equipment. The state must approve all faculty before they are hired. School financial condition is reviewed before a school receives its license.

Minnesota

A uniform tracking system for higher education, to be used in part to provide consumer information, was mandated by the legislature in 1989 for both public and proprietary schools. However, issuance of new Federal regulations has postponed development of the system. From the technical colleges, the state currently collects information on the number of completers and placement information, including relationship of placement to training, with each college determining its own method for contacting graduates. Community colleges provide completion data by sex and race, and collect placement data through graduate surveys. The Community College System is developing an automated information system and plans to collect wage rate data. A student outcome project was pilot tested at two community colleges. Proprietary schools report maximum and current enrollments and, if they have a placement service, the number of completers and placement rates. State law prohibits the collection of wage data from these schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The State Board of Vocational Education oversees 30 public technical colleges, which are attended by about 50,000 students and 500,000 extension students. The 18 schools in the Minnesota Community Colleges System are attended by about 54,000 students of which 18 percent are enrolled in vocational education programs. Private vocational schools are overseen by the Department of Education. Currently, Minnesota licenses 80 proprietary schools that do not grant degrees; additional schools are awaiting licensure. Approximately 20,000 students attend the private vocational schools.

Negative reports about postsecondary outcomes appeared in the local press in Minnesota during the 1980s. Consequently, in 1989, the legislature mandated the state's public postsecondary governing boards and private proprietary institutions to review and/or establish procedures for collecting data on the job placement of the graduates of their vocational programs. The Higher Education Coordinating Board was required to coordinate the reviews and submit a report to the legislature by February 15, 1990. The information from this report was to be used to develop a uniform tracking system for higher education. This system would be used in part to provide consumer information to students and prospective students.

While the state was reviewing its placement tracking systems, the federal government issued regulations on the reporting of completion and placement data for vocational programs below the bachelor's level. Since the federal reporting requirements differ from the state systems, it was thought that users would be confused by having to provide two different sets of data. Therefore, the report recommended the postponement of the development of the state's uniform tracking system. It also endorsed the efforts of the postsecondary community in the state to revise federal reporting requirements.

Public Schools

Technical Colleges. The state collects information on the number of completers from the public technical colleges. A completer is defined as one who has completed the graduation requirements of the college attended. The information on completers is categorized by rase and sex.

The public technical colleges provide placement information to the state by January 15 each year. Each college determines how the graduates will be contacted--by mail, by telephone, or in person. In reporting the data to the state, the colleges may submit a 9-track magnetic tape, enter data on-line to the state computers, use their own software to produce and submit an ASCII file, or use manual reporting.

For each graduate from the previous fiscal year, the colleges must give the job title of those employed, a job title qualifier if necessary, and the reason that unavailable graduates are not looking for work. In determining the relationship between placement and training, the state uses a job title qualifier and has state curriculum specialists and other experts determine if the job uses at least 50 percent of the curriculum. The vocational technical system is required to close programs with related placement rates falling below a minimum percent, which for many years was 51 percent. However, one recommendation in the report on placement tracking systems was to remove reference to placement rates as a mandatory criterion for program evaluation.

The public technical colleges collect wage data but this is not a state reporting requirement. Minnesota requests, but does not require, colleges to collect data on success rates in career licensing. Basic skills test scores also are reported to the state. These data are collected by an independent assessment firm. A booklet containing the analyzed data is sent to the colleges. Data are available to students and the general public.

Two processes are used to monitor accuracy of data from public technical colleges: product audit and fiscal audit. A product audit is used to assess placement relatedness. To check the accuracy of the data from each school, an auditor contacts a random selection of graduates as well as all graduates in certain selected programs. All colleges undergo a product audit annually. Fiscal audits are conducted on six colleges per year; during the site visits, student data are reviewed.

Pending legislation is addressing the topic of consumer rights information. It is expected that a task force will be established. Currently a moratorium prohibits technical colleges from publishing placement data. An effort is underway to redesign the employment follow-up system, after which reporting will resume.

The State Board of Vocational Technical Education is exploring the feasibility of working with the job service of the Department of Jobs and Training for obtaining job placement and employment follow-up information.

Community Colleges. The community colleges provide completion information to the state. A completer is one who has been awarded an associate degree, diploma, or certificate; information is available by gender and racial/ethnic status. The agency is currently developing an analysis system for completion rates. All colleges are required to collect placement information by surveying their graduates. A measure of placement has been formulated but not yet implemented.

The Community Colleges System is developing new policies about the measurement of outcomes. Schools will be required to collect wage rate information. They also will be collecting success rates on career licensing tests annually from the private institutes that do the license testing. Effective fall 1990, a mandatory assessment program will be implemented to measure basic skills at the completion of a program; the agency is still seeking an appropriate instrument.

The Community Colleges System has a centralized automated information system. The schools enter data such as enrollment, student demographics, completion, and placement directly into the system.

Analysis systems for these data currently are being developed. No formal audits of these data are done. Printouts are sent to the schools two times each quarter to check on the accuracy of the data. Placement data are checked as a part of the regular biannual college review. A summary report of placement information is planned.

A student outcomes pilot project was conducted at two community colleges. Among the components of the project were a placement survey of graduates one year after graduation, an extended survey of graduates five years after graduation, and a survey of non-returning non-graduates' placement, college evaluations, and college experiences.

Proprietary Schools

Schools must report maximum enrollment and current enrollment to the state. Overenrollment could result in licensure revocation but underenrollment is not considered a problem. Schools providing a placement service must report the number of completers and placement rates. Placement rate is based on the percentage of placed graduates who are in a job related to their training. The measurement is made 12 months after completion. State law prohibits the agency from requiring schools to submit wage information. The agency contacts employers to verify placement rate data and to assess whether the placement is related to the training received; this is done at least annually during the licensing process. Placement tracking information, also collected by the Minnesota Association of Private Post-Secondary Schools, is included in the state reports.

The information on proprietary schools is used by the legislature and the Governor to amend legislation and policies. Schools found with deficiencies receive feedback about the conditions they must meet in order to retain their licenses. The state publishes a directory of licensed schools that is available to the general public.

Mississippi

Completion and placement rates are reported for community college students in Mississippi, separated out by sex, race, handicap, and disadvantagement. Programs are ranked using z-scores, with the lowest 25 percent evaluated. For license renewals, proprietary schools submit information about completion and placement rates.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Junior College Division has approval authority over the vocational/technical courses at the 15 community colleges in Mississippi. However, all reporting is done through the Vocational and Technical Education Bureau in the Department of Education. About 120 licensed proprietary schools enrolling approximately 20,000 students are overseen by the Proprietary School and College Registration Division of the State Department of Education.

Public Schools

The state collects completion rates for community college students. Completers are full-time students who have finished all requirements of a program. Data on progress toward completion also are collected. Placement rates are calculated for completers who are "not back in a program;" the individual schools decide if a placement is directly related, indirectly related, or not related at all to the training program. Separate completion and placement rates can be calculated by gender and race and for handicapped and disadvantaged students.

The community colleges submit computer printouts on completion and placement rates annually. Starting in 1989, the state ranked programs using z-scores based on enrollment, retention, and placement. Programs in the lowest 25 percent will be evaluated. This information is distributed to the schools; teachers may review it to see how their programs are doing. It is not disclosed to students or the general public. It is used for management decisions only. It is expected that the ranking system will result in program modification or cancellation.

The state sends a sample survey to the schools that can be used for student follow up. Schools are not required to use the form. When the forms are utilized, students return them to the schools; the data are used by the schools and not forwarded to the state.

The state does collect information on school financial condition and facilities and equipment.

Proprietary Schools

The state receives some performance data from the proprietary schools every two years when the schools renew their licenses. Completion rates are collected and are based on the number of graduates in a program; both full-time and part-time students are included in the calculation. Placement rates based on the number of graduates in jobs related to their programs also are collected. The schools decide if a job is related to a program and use the Dictionary of Occupational Titles to make their decision.

Some schools send computer printouts, but all must use a written format. The state uses the data for licensing renewal only. The schools use the data for program changes. Disclosure is not made to students or the general public.

The data are reviewed during site visits made every two years as a part of the licensing process. Since the state has no standardized, required record keeping procedures, problems arise concerning how the data are collected and recorded.

Missouri

A statewide performance indicator system recently has been established in Missouri for both public and proprietary schools. The system includes graduation rates, retention rates, academic and cognitive measures, student opinions, and license testing results.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Coordinating Board for Higher Education has budget making responsibility over the 13 community college districts, each with three campuses. Altogether about 50,000 students attend the community colleges. The board has licensure responsibility over the 162 proprietary schools, which enroll about 31,000 students.

A statewide performance indicator system recently has been established. This will include graduation rates, retention rates, cognitive measures, a survey of academic performance, student opinions, and a survey of withdrawing students. Vocational schools also will provide the results of licensure tests. The first year in which schools will be required to report is 1991.

The new performance indicators system grew out of a desire by the Education Coordinating Board, the Higher Education Division, and the Governor to have a better sense of postsecondary education outcomes. The intent of the system is to provide feedback to the institutions about the outcomes and to foster improvement. Currently under consideration is the strengthening of the role of the Education Coordinating Board in the implementation of the indicators system. For example, the Board may be given the power to defund programs that fail to meet required standards.

Public Schools

The Coordinating Board for Higher Education collects information from the public schools on the make-up of its student body. Among the data collected are age, sex, race, and degree status. As part of a Student Achievement Study, additional information is being collected including American College Testing (ACT) scores, educational degree aspiration, and vocational choice.

Proprietary Schools

The Coordinating Board for Higher Education is in its fourth year of jurisdiction of the proprietary schools in Missouri. As part of the requirements for certification, the Board collects statistical information and publishes it in a Directory and Statistical Summary: Proprietary Sector of Missouri Postsecondary Education. Among the information included are the prior education level of entering students and enrollment by gender, race, and age.

Montana

During a period of transition in Montana, a set of common program evaluation standards is being developed for public vocational/technical centers. A manual for standardizing data collection and reporting is undergoing revision. For proprietary schools, the state collects school data (e.g., finances, faculty, curriculum, advertising) and copies of certificates of completion.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Montana has five vocational/technical centers enrolling about 2,700 students. Additional vocational programs are located in three community colleges and one four-year institution, which have a combined enrollment of approximately 2,300 students. Vocational/technical programs in the state of Montana were reorganized in 1987. On July 1, 1989, the Board of Regents was given governance over the vocational/technical centers.

The Professional and Occupational Licensing Bureau of the Department of Commerce oversees 31 proprietary schools but its main function is to oversee small businesses. Cosmetology schools are overseen by the Cosmetology Board.

Public Schools

As a result of the reorganization of vocational/technical programs, the state is in a period of transition regarding the collection and reporting of data. A transition group is developing program evaluation standards--a set of common criteria on which programs will be evaluated. Areas such as available resources, faculty qualifications, student evaluation, enrollment, completion, and placement are either under consideration or are being actively developed. A manual for standardizing data collection and the reporting of information on enrollment, placement, and follow up was piloted in fall 1989; this manual is currently under revision.

Proprietary Schools

The state collects copies of the certificates of completion from proprietary schools but does not count them. No placement or earnings information is collected. Schools are required to provide information on their financial condition, faculty qualifications, curriculum and course outlines, length of courses in relation to cost, and advertising.

Nebraska

Nebraska presently does not collect any measures of performance from the community technical colleges, although recent legislation requires the collection, once every five years, of number of graduates per program and credit hours for each faculty member. This is less information than collected in the past. The state collects completion and placement data from proprietary schools, but not rates, and breaks the data down by institution and program. Pending legislation and a constitutional amendment could change data collection processes for both public and proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Nebraska's Postsecondary Education system is comprised of 24 institutions serving approximately 108,156 students. It is organized under several autonomous governing entities: the multi-campus University of Nebraska system overseen by its Board of Regents, 7 public community technical colleges managed in seven administrative units, and 15 private four-year colleges and 2 two-year colleges governed by the Board of Trustees of Nebraska State Colleges. Six of the community technical colleges are administered under locally elected School Boards. The seventh is an agriculture technical college under the University of Nebraska at Lincoln. All together they serve approximately 31,482 vocational students.

The state's 50 postsecondary proprietary schools serving an estimated 10,639 students are overseen by the State Board of Education, and licensed by the Department of Education's Vocational Education Division.

Public Schools

The state does not collect measures of performance from the community technical colleges. However, recent legislation requires the Coordinating Commission for Higher Education to conduct individual program reviews every five years for appropriations purposes. The stipulated review criteria limits data collection to two areas: the number of graduates per program and the number of credit hours generated annually by each faculty member. Collected information is analyzed, conclusions drawn, and the Commission's program review report submitted to the legislature for use in funding decisions. As the Commission has no oversight authority over these schools, no site visits of any kind are made. Information is submitted on standardized forms prepared by the Commission. Any apparent discrepancies in the data are corrected through telephone calls.

A newly passed constitutional amendment, subject to voter approval in the fall 1990 general election and effective January 1992, would greatly dilute the autonomy of the public governing boards by giving the Coordinating Commission for Higher Education greater regulatory authority over public postsecondary education. The Commission would have authority over the coordination of all public postsecondary educational institutions in three key areas:

- The development and adoption of a comprehensive statewide plan for postsecondary education.
- Approval of all programs and capital construction projects for compliance and consistency with the comprehensive plan.
- Approval of all budget requests of the local boards and any future governing board the legislature may establish for oversight of public postsecondary educational institutions.

The constitutional amendment also would permit the legislature to choose between a single board or an association representing the community colleges as the means of coordinating these schools.

Prior to 1985, the state collected and maintained performance outcomes information in the Vocational Education Data System (VEDS). Among the outcome information collected were completion and placement data, relationship of placement to training, earnings, and gains in basic and job skills. A completer was anyone who was either awarded the associate degree or certificate, or completed a training program. Completion rates were not calculated. Placement was defined as any completer subsequently employed, regardless the relationship of the job to training. However, the state kept separate counts of those placed in related and unrelated jobs, as well as those unplaced. Completers were surveyed for placement and initial wage levels one year after graduation. Through the survey data were collected on completion, placement, and earnings, which were categorized by gender, racial/ethnic group, and handicap.

Information on gains in basic or job skills and relationship of placement to training also were obtained in the past through employer surveys conducted simultaneously with the completer placement surveys.

The state made annual site visits to participating institutions to verify data accuracy and help the schools organize data bases.

Statewide figures were compiled and disseminated in an annual report distributed to the state legislature, the U.S. Department of Education, and the general public.

These efforts may be revived in whole or part with potential provisions under the proposed state constitutional amendment. According to the Commission's executive director, an institutional accountability report incorporating some measures of performance may become a reporting requirement. However, this would necessitate the development of a statewide accountability program, which potentially would take time to finalize.

Proprietary Schools

The state's 50 proprietary schools include private vocational/technical institutes. The state collects completion and placement data only. This is done annually on standardized forms prepared by the State Department of Education's Vocational Education Division. Additionally, the schools are encouraged to conduct follow-up surveys of completers to gauge relationship of placement to training and earnings levels.

Completion and placement rates are not calculated. The state counts the total number who completed each program based upon award of diploma or certificate, and breaks down the data by institution and program. Placement is strictly defined as employment in the area of training. The assessment is done by the schools one year after graduation through a state-prepared standardized form, which includes total counts of students placed in training related and unrelated jobs. Data are collected on initial placement only, but schools are urged to voluntarily conduct additional follow-up surveys at three and six months intervals after that. Placement data are broken down by institution and program.

Schools are also encouraged to survey completers for job satisfaction, training relatedness, and earnings levels. The information is not collected at state level but is reviewed during site visits. Success rates in career licensing tests are not collected as most participating schools do not have programs requiring career licensing as a condition of employment.

The Office of Proprietary Schools in the Division of Vocational Education reported that understaffing precluded annual site visits to all participating institutions. However, problem schools are visited regularly to review administrative and other records. Data accuracy is monitored through interviews with administrative staff, faculty, and students during the visits. Noncompliance with information requirements is reportedly very low; the only data inaccuracies found are attributable to a school's genuine misunderstanding of definition of terms under the reporting requirements.

The data collection efforts are aimed for both consumer rights' purposes and management decisions. The state disseminates the information in a biannual report distributed to the legislature and the general public. The report lists all licensed proprietary schools, programs offered at each school, plus enrollment, completion and placement data.

A 1978 legislative action made proprietary students eligible for state financial aid. However, a 1985 state Supreme Court ruling limited state aid to students attending nine-month and longer programs.

State accreditation is done every three years. The statute requires the schools to submit a self-study report and a plan for future growth. The self-study report must include an assessment of completion and placement rate, faculty qualifications, and the school's financial condition. The institutional growth plan must include identified ways to enhance faculty qualifications, increase student enrollment and retention, and improve facilities and equipment. On occasion a school has been closed down for statute violation.

Pending legislation is expected to generate new policies designed to increase state authority over proprietary schools. Its provisions give the State Board of Education the latitude and some funding to establish new regulatory standards, such as minimum faculty qualifications, policy requirements on tuition refunds and consumer rights information for potential students, and specific recruiting guidelines to minimize false advertising and other student abuses. The bill was sponsored by the proprietary schools themselves and received overwhelming support by the legislature, regulatory agencies, and trade and industry associations.

Nevada

Nevada does not collect any measures of performance from its community colleges, although each campus must submit an assessment plan that involves a multiple assessment approach. Annual completion rates are the only measures collected from proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Nevada has four community colleges with a total of approximately 32,500 students. The Postsecondary Education Commission oversees the 109 proprietary schools in Nevada, 13 of which offer degrees. About 11,500 students attend the proprietary schools.

Public Schools

No measures of performance are collected from the community colleges. The Board of Regents has passed a policy that by the spring of 1990, each campus must submit an assessment plan that involves a multiple assessment approach. The campuses have been asked to work together and utilize a common approach whenever possible.

Proprietary Schools

Annual completion rates are the only performance measures collected from proprietary schools. The calculation is based on the number of students enrolled and the number completing the program. A completer is defined as one who completes 75 percent of the school program. No distinction is made between full-time and part-time students. The information is used in making management decisions.

New Hampshire

Technical colleges in New Hampshire report the number, but not rates, of graduates. Placement rates are calculated through student surveys, with most students indicating starting salaries as well. Three- and five-year follow-up surveys on earnings will be done, with results reported by program. The state does not collect any data of any kind from proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Department of Postsecondary Technical Education oversees technical colleges with programs leading to two-year degrees. The seven technical colleges have 2,700 full-time day students and about 20,000 mostly part-time students in the Division of Community Education. The state does not have an oversight board for private schools.

Public Schools

The technical colleges provide the state with the number of students who graduated from a certificate, diploma, or degree program, but completion rates are not calculated. Placement rates are calculated, and the total number of graduates is compared to the number employed, the number not looking for jobs, the number transferred to another school, and the number entering the military. Students are surveyed just before graduation in June; those without jobs are followed by mail and direct contact until November. The state is beginning to consider collecting information on attrition and financial aid.

Students are asked about starting salaries. Approximately 80 percent return this information. For the first time, the state is in the process of doing a three- and five-year follow up on earnings.

Schools use state forms to submit the information, which is collected once a year. Analyses of placement rates and earnings information are done by program. Data are arranged into graphs, charts, and tables for individual colleges and systemwide summaries.

A report is prepared at the state level for the Governor, the legislature, and the school system. The data are used to determine the viability of programs and efficiency of operation; they are not used for consumer rights purposes.

Each of the schools compiles a brochure that contains school specific information. The brochures are given to students at admission and used for marketing. Copies are provided to libraries and businesses and industries in the state.

Proprietary Schools

The state does not collect data of any kind about proprietary schools.

Data collection efforts from community colleges in New Jersey are just beginning. Graduation rates are collected, but not using a uniform definition. Pre- and posttest results on the reading, writing, and mathematics subtests of the New Jersey College Basic Skills Placement Tests are reported by institution and program. Annually, proprietary schools report new enrollees, dropouts, completers, and placement rates by program area.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The 19 community colleges in New Jersey are overseen by the Department of Higher Education. The Office of Private Vocational Schools in the Division of Vocational Education is responsible for 230 private vocational, technical, and business schools with nondegree programs. Some of the approximately 45,000 students who attend these programs earn certificates. Schools of nursing, truck driving, casino dealing, real estate, cosmetology, and barbering are overseen by their individual boards or commissions.

Public Schools

The state is just starting to collect information on graduation rates from community colleges. At this point the measures are not well defined. The state also is considering collecting data on retention.

Every community college student must take the New Jersey College Basic Skills Placement Tests in reading, writing, and mathematics. Both pre- and posttests are given. Analyses are done by college and by program. An annual report is submitted to the state, and provided to the Board of Higher Education, the press, high schools in the state, and the general public. Disclosure also is made to students and potential students. The data are used in making management decisions and, to some degree, for consumer rights.

Proprietary Schools

Once each year the private schools report new enrollments, dropouts, and completers. Both full-time and part-time students are included in the count. Placement rates, defined as a percentage of completers, are calculated by program and for the school as a whole. The information is provided in written format to the state which compiles it into a large report. Analysis is done by school and by program. The reporting is done about four to six months after the data are collected. The data are used for some management decisions and to keep the public informed. No regular monitoring of compliance or accuracy is conducted. However, any information used in an advertising brochure must be verified.

New Mexico

In New Mexico, postsecondary vocational/technical institutes report information on completion and placement rates, relationship of placement to training, and earnings information. Much of this information is collected through required annual follow-up surveys of completers/leavers and their employers. Placement data are summarized by trade, gender, and racial/ethnic group. Recent legislation established an institutional accountability program that mandates collection of performance measures. The state does not collect any performance measures from proprietary schools, although enrollment and completion totals, by program, are included on annual license application forms.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The New Mexico Commission for Higher Education is the coordinating board for the state's public and private postsecondary and higher education institutions. Thus, the Commission oversees 112 proprietary schools and 29 public and nonpublic postsecondary and higher education institutions. Of the latter, 23 are public colleges with 6 four-year colleges (one of which offers two-year certificate programs) and 17 two-year institutes that offer a wide range of academic transfer, vocational-technical education, and community service programs. The other six are nonpublic colleges: 4 four-year colleges and 2 two-year, Native American institutions. All together the institutions serve approximately 70,000 students. Among these, 22,000 attend the two-year colleges with roughly 13,000 enrolled in the vocational/technical programs.

The state's 112 proprietary schools are licensed by the Commission on Higher Education and governed under the 1978 licensure legislation. The Commission has limited oversight responsibility for proprietary institutions. Data on the number of students attending those schools is not available.

Public Schools

The Vocational-Technical and Adult Education Division of the State Department of Education collects measures of performance from the 17 postsecondary vocational/technical institutes, including completion and placement rates, relationship of placement to training, and earnings information. The Division obtains a hard copy of school-provided data for the various analyses. The completer is either the recipient of a certificate, diploma, the associate or full degree, or, for the vocational/technical students, completion of a whole sequence of courses for a two-year program. A standard definition of a completer currently is being developed. The completion rate is computed for full-time graduates only.

The State Department of Education has defined placement as the full-time or part-time completers employed in their area of training. To determine placement rates, relationship of placement to training, and earning levels, the schools are required to conduct annual follow-up surveys of completers/leavers of vocational-technical programs and their employers. Information collected by survey questionnaires is organized by program under ten categories: those who sought employment, found employment, were unemployed, were unemployed seeking work, obtained employment, were continuing education, were not in the labor force, had unknown status, average hourly wage earned, and average employer rating. The data are then aggregated under three categories: those available for employment, those currently employed, and the number unable to find work. The placement rate is computed as the percentage ratio of the total number employed to the total available for employment for a given academic year. Placement information is summarized by trade, gender, racial, and ethnic groups.

The annual employer satisfaction survey helps to gauge gains in job skills and the relationship of placement to training by asking the employer to rate the completer's job performance on a 5-point scale. The employer responds to the question as to whether employee job performance at entry level is commensurate with two-year training. The average employer rating is computed for full-time employees only. Gains in basic skills are not collected at state level, although the adult basic examination (ABE) is routinely administered at entry for adult programs. Earnings information is collected on entry salary levels and computed for average hourly wage and average annual salaries, for full-time employees only.

Site visits are conducted annually to assure compliance with education standards, for instance, review of recruitment process, student services, and others. Site visit reports are supplied to participating institutions and remediation of deficiencies enforced. The Commission on Higher Education uses independent auditors to verify funding-related information for its report to the legislature.

The state produces an end-of-the-year report from hard copy of school-provided information, used only for the Division's management decisions. The analyses and evaluative interpretation of the school conducted follow-up studies is compiled into an annual vocational/ technical education follow-up report available to the public upon request. This report does not include student loan default rates as a measure of performance, and neither is that information a reporting requirement of the schools. However, the state follow-up report does contain information on the type of financial aid students received, for instance, basic grant, loans, college work study, social security, and others.

Recent legislation promises to expand and enhance the quality of education at two-year institutes as part of a statewide overhaul plan to improve the participation rate in higher education. The legislation mandates the Commission for Higher Education to develop a statewide five-year planning process, including institutional planning guidelines under which aforementioned measures of performance would be collected and projections for improvement and growth made on five-year basis. The Commission will assist each institution to develop its own five-year plan to assure consistency with mandated statewide guidelines, and suggest annual updates accordingly.

Within the statewide planning process the legislation also establishes the institutional accountability program under which measures of performance will be collected. These will include completion and placement rates, relationship of placement to training, and gains in basic or job skills. The Commission will develop a statewide criteria for assessing educational outcomes and will determine specific assessment indicators. The state will assist each school to develop its own assessment procedure that suits its informational and program needs, for instance, retention studies, research activities such as follow-up studies of graduates, and assessing successful students in either continuing education or employment. The institutional accountability report will be submitted in hard copy as part of the five-year plan.

Follow-up studies of graduates are still to be used to generate placement information. The data will be summarized under five completer categories: type of employment, military service, continuing education and location, unemployed, and status unknown. An added dimension of the follow-up study will be the assessment of flight from state over time by discipline or trade and suggestions for plans to reverse the trend.

The statewide plan requires site visits during which institutional plans will be reviewed.

The data collected will be used in funding decisions, initiating new programs, etc., as well as for consumer rights purposes. The information will be published in the following Commission reports.

- The institutional accountability reports will be compiled into the Annual Report of the Statewide Assessment Results. In addition, legislation requires the institutions to publish in a community newspaper their summaries of achievements and expenditures.
- The Statewide Plan for Higher Education will be made available for review by the legislature, the Governor, other institutions, and the general public.
- Institutional plans will be made available for review by other institutions updating or implementing their own plans for new program development and resource allocation.

These legislative initiatives followed findings of a mandated investigation of the Commission on Higher Education that revealed on a macro level that New Mexico's participation in higher education was lower than national averages.

Proprietary Schools

No measures of performance are collected at the state level for proprietary schools as these data are not required under the licensure law. However, the schools annually submit enrollment and completion totals, as well as the new courses offered, as part of the license application. These are submitted on standard forms prepared by the Commission. Completion data are collected by institution and program. A completer is regarded as anyone awarded a certificate of completion.

Site visits are limited to problem schools due to staff shortage. The state generally relies on the integrity of school official for data accuracy.

The data collected are used to compile the annual state directory of proprietary schools. It lists the number of proprietary schools statewide and their business status (licensed, unlicensed, exempt, accredited) and programs offered. The directory is widely disseminated to the public. Investigative reports on problems schools are available to the public on request.

State efforts to oversee proprietary schools have been very frustrated due to the limitations of the 1978 statute. For instance, the New York Technical Institute recently suffered financial difficulties and closed down its site in Santa Fe. New Mexico students suffered tuition losses, which include payable Pell Grants and other student loans. This and other well-publicized experiences have prompted the Commission on Higher Education to sponsor legislation seeking greater state regulatory authority over proprietary schools. An advisory council is revising the proposed legislation for effectiveness. Meanwhile, the Commission is developing a performance outcome reporting system for implementation under the proposed legislation.

New York

- In New York, IPEDS was used as a guide for data collection from public schools. Enrollments and number of degrees are reported annually by sex and race/ethnicity. Also reported are student loan default rates, faculty quality, and school facilities. There are mre stringent requirements for proprietary schools than for public schools. From these schools, the state collects information on the number of completers, placement rates, and whether placement is related to training. The proprietary schools are required to publish their enrollment, completion, and placement rates in their catalogs.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Bureau of Academic Programs Review oversees all colleges that award degrees, including associate degrees. The 124 schools consist of 30 public community colleges, 13 other public colleges, 26 proprietary degree granting schools, 22 two-year independent nonprofit schools, and 33 other independent nonprofit colleges. Together they enroll about 260,000 students.

The Division of Proprietary Schools oversees all postsecondary, nondegree-granting institutions, including licensed technical and trade schools. About 360 schools enrolling approximately 150,000 students are in this category.

Public Schools

The Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS) was used as a guideline for the data collected by the state. Colleges and universities must provide degree-credit enrollment for full-time and part-time students and categorize these students by gender and racial/ethnic status. Schools also must provide noncredit enrollment. For students in occupationally specific programs, enrollments must be shown by racial/ethnic category and sex of student; IPEDS codes are used to identify programs. The state also collects the number of degrees and certificates conferred by each school. Graduation rate data for full-time, first-time freshmen and full-time undergraduate transfer students by racial/ethnic category are collected by the state. The data measure retention patterns of students and indicate the amount of time needed to complete undergraduate degree programs, including associate degrees. The state does not collect placement rates, earnings information, or basic skills data.

The state collects enrollment and completion data annually. Every two years all schools must complete an extensive questionnaire on topics ranging from recruitment of women and campus climate to finances and facilities. The data are entered into a computer at the Department of Education. Enrollment and number of degrees awarded are included in a number of reports prepared by the State Education Department. This information is used by both the secondary and postsecondary schools. Members of the public can obtain information by calling the Department directly.

The state makes site visits to the schools for auditing and accreditation purposes. The state comptroller audits the administration of the state and federal aid programs. As a part of the accreditation process, schools must submit a self-study report. If the schools conduct any surveys of graduates or employers, they are to be included in the report on the self-study. Visiting teams verify the information in the report. If a program does not meet accreditation standards, the Bureau of Academic Programs Review has the authority to terminate it. Other penalties that have been used are banning new admissions to a program and completely shutting down a school.

The Bureau requires schools to provide information on student loan default rates. Faculty quality and library and laboratory facilities also are monitored by the state.

Proprietary Schools

The state collects the number of students who were awarded a certificate or diploma following program completion; this number is subdivided by gender and full-time and part-time students. Placement rates are collected for completers. Categories of placement are related placement, slightly related placement, unrelated placement, military employment, seeking employment, pursuing further education, other/unavailable for employment, and status unknown.

The data are aggregated and standardized by the Division and made available to the reporting schools. The schools are required to publish enrollment and completion and placement rates in their catalogues. The accuracy rate for enrollment and completion information was said to be high, but the accuracy rate of placement rates is low. The state conducts random spot checks on schools suspected of or known to report false placement data. Schools found reporting false information receive heavy penalties, such as closing down the programs for which false data were given.

The information is used by the Governor and the legislature, by the postsecondary schools for policy making, and by secondary schools for student counseling.

North Carolina

The only data reported by community colleges in North Carolina is number of completers, reported by program. New adoption of "27 Measures of Effectiveness" will require school-wide reporting of additional data, including number of students retained from previous quarters and employer satisfaction with graduates. Proprietary schools presently report only enrollment numbers at the beginning of each year.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The North Carolina Community College System consists of 58 community colleges, which enroll about 218,000 students in their curriculum programs and 272,000 students in their occupational extension programs. Curriculum programs are technical or college transfer programs leading to a degree, certificate, or diploma. Occupational extension programs do not lead to a credential; some of these programs may be designed for a particular employer. Private schools involving licensed occupations, such as cosmetology, barbering, and truck driving, are administered by the individual licensing boards. The Board of Community Colleges approves the remaining 42 proprietary schools, which enroll approximately 6,000 students.

The Education Assistance Authority provides financing for students, generally in the form of loans. It has no direct involvement in licensure, accreditation, or the measurement of performance.

According to the Governor's Education Advisor, the Southern Association of Colleges and Schools (SACS) has influenced the types of measures collected by the state. SACS, an accrediting body for both public and nonpublic schools, has changed its accreditation requirements from input to outcome measures.

Public Schools

The community colleges collect information on the number of completers. A completer is anyone who receives a degree, certificate, or diploma. The state is discussing measuring progress of students toward completion and the retention of students. The state does not collect placement rates or earnings information.

Schools provide the data on computer tapes on a quarterly basis. Analysis is done by school and by program.

The data are provided to the Governor's education advisor, the legislature, and the schools themselves. The data are used at the school level for planning purposes and at the state level for budget allocations. The community colleges are 85 percent subsidized by the state.

In July 1989, the State Board of Community Colleges adopted "27 Measures of Effectiveness," which will be used to measure the community college system as a whole rather than individual schools. In selecting the measures, an emphasis was placed on ones that could be reported in 1990 with data that already were being collected. However, some of the measures will require additional data collection; these include the number of students retained from previous quarters and employer satisfaction with graduates.

Proprietary Schools

The proprietary schools are required only to provide enrollment numbers at the beginning of the year. A legislative research committee is studying proprietary schools to determine if laws need to be strengthened.

North Dakota

In North Dakota, the state collects enrollment, completion, and placement data from public vocational education programs. They also report on curricula and programs. Proprietary schools report number of completers and school characteristics in their annual license renewal applications and are requested, but not required, to submit placement and earnings data.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Department of Vocational Education oversees vocational programs in 3 community colleges, 6 four-year colleges, and 2 two-year institutes. The Department also is responsible for licensure of 11 proprietary schools but has no authority over cosmetology schools.

The North Dakota legislature meets biannually; it will be back in session in 1991. The Interim Legislative Committee on Education did not receive any request for legislation addressing the performance outcomes issue.

Public Schools

The Department of Vocational Education collects enrollment and completion data from vocational education programs. A completer is defined as one who completes either a planned sequence of courses or all the competencies for the program. Data are collected by race and sex. A follow-up survey is required six months after program completion. Placement information is divided into six categories: employed in a field related to training, employed in a field unrelated to training, employed by the military, continuing education, unemployed, and status unknown. Earnings information was collected in the past but is not collected currently.

Each year the Department of Vocational Education sends schools a computer print-out listing all programs. The schools enter information on enrollment, completion, and placement on the printouts and return them to the Department. A report on enrollments, completers, number of schools, programs, and curricula is submitted to the State Board of Higher Education. The information primarily is used by the postsecondary schools themselves to review enrollment changes over time. The data are not normally disseminated to students or the general public but are available on request.

The Higher Education Department collects enrollment and completion information from the community colleges and maintains the data in a central mainframe computer system. Completers are those who have received an associate degree, diploma, or certificate. Completion data are reported annually and enrollment data are reported each term; this is considered primarily a procedural exercise. A booklet with programs offered in the community colleges and a list of graduates in each field of study is compiled by the Department and made available to the general public. The Higher Education Department does not collect placement or earnings information.

Proprietary Schools

In the annual license renewal requests, proprietary schools must include the number of completers. Placement and earnings information is requested but not required. To be approved as a business, the school must submit a license application containing the source of financial backing, faculty qualifications, a list of agents, and bonding procedures. Information from the applications is summarized in a report to the State Higher Education Board.

Each school receives an annual site visit by the Department of Vocational Education. Activities during the visit include the verification of reported data, checking compliance with legislation, and follow up on student complaints. A financial review of schools is done annually. If a school does not meet approval requirements, it is closed down.

Ohio collects information on enrollment and completion, placement rates, and initial wage rates from public postsecondary schools. Individual instructors are responsible for collecting the annual follow-up information on completers/leavers, including current educational and employment status, current salary, and relationship of employment to training. New legislation requires proprietary schools to report completion and placement rates.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

State responsibility for postsecondary vocational/technical training in Ohio is spread across several government agencies. Contact was made with the State Board for Proprietary School Education and The Division of Vocational and Career Education in the Department of Education, which is responsible for public programs for part-time and full-time adults and Perkins Act funded apprenticeship training. In spite of multiple attempts to contact the Board of Regents, information for full-time for-credit programs was not able to be obtained.

There is a fairly large vocational/technical education sector in Ohio. Some 209,000 adults are enrolled in supplemental programs, 70,000 adults are enrolled in full-time programs for displaced workers and those making mid-career changes, and over 6,000 are enrolled in Perkins Act funded apprenticeship programs. There are also 365 proprietary and 67 private non/profit postsecondary vocational/technical schools in the state.

Ohio collects information on enrollment and completion, placement rates and initial wage rates. Recent legislation extended information requirements to the proprietary schools. The responsibility for collecting the follow-up information on completers is given to individual instructors. Their information is assembled by the schools but is reported to the state by instructor.

A special longitudinal study of secondary level vocational/technical programs is being conducted by the Department of Economics at Ohio University. The study design calls for the use of IRS data matched with the social security numbers of those enrolling in vocational courses.

Public Schools

The major thrust of state information collection is an annual follow-up survey of program completers and leavers. Those ending participation in a program during a July through June annual cycle are contacted the following February or March. The follow-up survey requests information on current educational and employment status, current salary, and whether employment is related to the training received.

The follow-up survey is administered by the instructors using a standard state-supplied form. Completers of full-time programs as of June are surveyed in February or March of the following year. Information is aggregated for each instructor and each program, and reported to the State Division of Vocational Education.

The placement results from the follow-up survey are published in a booklet that is sent to all school districts, the State Board of Education, and, on some occasions, to all members of the General Assembly. The information also is provided to the schools and instructors. The schools may decide to use the information for local marketing efforts. Information on wages is not published. The major analysis of the data conducted by the state is a comparison of the data from these programs with general employment data.

Compliance with the information requirements has been very good, as participation is required for continued funding. An on-site review of the data and the procedures used to collect it is conducted every five years. During the review, a sample of individual data collection forms is examined, and some graduates are contacted.

One use of the information by the programs is in demonstrating that they are marketable. Schools must show that each program is able to obtain training-related placements for its graduates, or the state may require that the program be discontinued. The state provides the individual school affected with the names of programs and instructors that do not achieve sufficiently high achievement rates.

Proprietary Schools

New state legislation has revised the requirements for measuring the performance of proprietary schools; completion and placement rates will be among the measures obtained. Rules for collecting the data will be ready in March 1990. Items contained in the state's default management plan are likely to be the core of this effort, as the schools will be required to collect this information anyway.

An annual report on proprietary schools has been sent to the Governor, the legislature, and libraries and other state agencies; copies are available for the individual schools on request. The report has been based on a survey that collected information on the number enrolled, the number of withdrawals, the number of completions, and the number of placements. Individual schools were free to develop their own definitions of these terms. The survey has not taken place in two years.

Oklahoma

For recipients of associate degrees, community colleges in Oklahoma submit data on semester-based enrollment and completion data for at the program level, which allows for calculation of retention-dropout rates, freshman progress analysis, etc. Negotiations are under way to access unemployment insurance wage data and employer files. Vocational/technical schools collect performance data for full-time students, including data on completion, placement, relationship of placement to training, and gains in basic and occupational skills. Completion and placement data are broken down by gender, race, handicapping conditions, and other minority groupings. The only performance outcome data collected from proprietary schools are enrollment and completion data as part of licensure requirements.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Oklahoma Regents for Higher Education oversees the state's degree granting postsecondary institutions. The agency defines the general term for all standardized core curricula, accredits the associate degree granting public and proprietary schools, and also serves as the state's official student loan guarantee agency. The Regents also holds limited oversight responsibility for the four postsecondary education Centers.

The state has 242 postsecondary and higher education institutions serving an estimated 191,000 students. The public sector is comprised of 77 institutions that include 12 four-year colleges and universities offering associate degrees, 13 community colleges, 4 Centers, and 48 Vocational/Technical Area Schools. The area vocational/technical schools are overseen by the Department of Vocational and Technical Education. They serve an estimated 20,000 daytime, full-time students plus thousands of others who take only brief series of courses to upgrade their skills on part time basis. Adult programs also are offered, hence articulation at the Area Centers is at both secondary and postsecondary levels.

The nonpublic institutions include 150 proprietary schools and 15 private independent colleges. The Oklahoma Private School Board is the licensing agency for the state's 150 proprietary schools. Among them, 30 are based out of state; 25 are nationally and regionally accredited. Accreditation makes the students eligible for state financial aid programs. The entire proprietary sector serves an estimated 21,000 students.

Public Schools

Community Colleges. The Regents of Higher Education systematically collect few measures of performance from the 13 community colleges. Semester-based enrollment and completion information to conduct a variety of institutional assessment analyses such as retention-dropout rates, freshman progress analysis, fiscal studies, and others for a variety of audiences. Data for retention-dropout analysis are collected two months after the semester ends and the freshman data two months after students complete their first year. Graduation data are submitted immediately after program completion.

Completers are defined as the recipients of associate degrees. The assessment information is submitted in computer tapes and maintained in a centralized data base at the Regents office. This provides the capability to collect additional measures of performance and conduct further institutional and student analyses as needed. Negotiations are under way for the Regents to be authorized access to the state wage data and employer files for use in student analyses.

Placement rates are collected at the program level. Gains in basic skills are assessed through entry and exit testing using a standardized test such as the ACT scores at admission and program-specific exams at completion. At entry students under 21 years of age must have acceptable scores in standardized tests prior to admission, but adults can be exempted from this.

Institution-specific retention/dropout study reports are distributed to respective participating schools. Studies of the progress of freshmen are sent to high schools as indicators of how their graduates are doing. These reports also are made available to the public on request. The assessment information also is used to compile a variety of specialized reports used for agency's internal management decisions.

The Regents centralized data base preempts the immediate need for site-visit verification. The current compliance and accuracy monitoring procedure amounts to each institution's review and correction of its own draft analytical profile as prepared by the Regents for Higher Education each semester. However, a policy initiative on retention rate studies is expected to require team site visits to verify schools compliance with minimum grade point average requirements and other data.

Oklahoma is reportedly experiencing an increase in community college enrollment prompted by the increases in university tuition and admission standards.

Vocational/Technical Schools. Performance outcomes, annually collected by the area vocational/technical schools only on the full-time students, include data on completion, placement, relationship of placement to training, and gains in basic and occupational skills. Each area voc/tech school defines its completer, generally someone who has completed an occupational program of study. Placement data are generated through follow-up surveys of completers conducted by the instructors nine months after the school year ends. Completers are grouped in terms of related or unrelated placement, military, continuing education, and other categories. Completion and placement information is broken down by gender, race, handicapped students, and other minority groups. Occupational competency tests, administered on optional basis using assessment instruments developed by the state, are used to assess student gains in basic and job skills. Test results also are used as indicators of program quality.

Performance outcome data are collected in hard copy and maintained in a central electronic data base. The effort is aimed at both management decisions and consumer rights purposes. Reports compiled from the school-provided information are distributed to the Governor and the legislature for appropriations legislation, other state government agencies for policy making, as well as to participating institutions and the general public. The State Department of Commerce and the Office of Civil Rights are among common users of the placement data. The state reportedly has no proposed or pending legislation dealing with postsecondary vocational programs.

Site visits are conducted for product and financial audits. Program review is done by occupational supervisors using program specific evaluation instruments. Schools reportedly have good working relations with the review supervisors. Accreditation reviews are conducted every five years by pertinent external teams. Administrative and financial audits are done annually. Verification of school-provided data is not done on site visits.

Proprietary Schools

Several years ago the Private Schools Association, using its own study of economic impact of proprietary schools, successfully lobbied the legislature that the private schools industry was a major economic force in the state and deserved an education board of its own. The effort resulted in the establishment of the Oklahoma Private School Board preempting the oversight role then played by the State Department of Education. It also marked the end of state level collection of performance outcome information such as enrollment, completion, and placement data.

Currently, enrollment and completion data are collected only as part of the licensure requirements. The completer is anyone who has satisfactorily completed all phases of a program. The information is collected annually on course-by-course basis.

The Board also conducts annual site visits during which administrative and financial records are reviewed, and facilities and equipment inspected. In addition, students are interviewed for their satisfaction with programs offered, quality of instruction, school recruitment methods and who recruited them, as well as for other concerns. Compliance with information requirements is reportedly high and relationship with participating institutions positive. Each school receives an evaluation report following the site visit. School deficiencies deemed unharmful to student learning can be remedied over a 30-day period. Fraudulent practices can lead to school loss of eligibility for student loan programs. School closure and license revocation involve a lengthy litigation process that tends to be tipped in favor of institutions.

Collected information is published in the annual directory of proprietary schools. The publication also lists a broad outline of courses offered.

Presently, there is no proposed or pending legislation addressing the performance outcome issue with respect to proprietary schools.

Oregon

Community colleges in Oregon report only IPEDS data to the state. A system to track completers through the unemployment insurance wage data system is under development. Apart from the norm in other states, proprietary schools are required to provide considerably more information to the state than are public schools. Recent legislation requires them annually to submit a substantial amount of information, mostly with license renewal applications. Included in this required information is enrollments, completions, and placements related to training, each by program area. Schools are placed on probation if their completion and placement rates fall below 75 percent of the state average. Additional required information includes number of students passing licensing exams, school characteristics (e.g., faculty, facilities, finances), and copies of advertising. The state uses "at-risk" indicators to review schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The 16 community colleges in Oregon enroll approximately 280,000 full- and part-time students. The state oversees 240 proprietary schools that are attended by about 24,000 students.

Public Schools

Only IPEDS data are collected from the community colleges by the Education Department. Community college students are given a basic skills test at the time of enrollment. The instrument, Basis, was developed by the state. It is used as a diagnostic and mastery test.

The Employment Division is in the process of developing a follow-up system that will track program completers from community colleges through the state wage data system. The colleges are providing social security numbers of graduates, program of training, CIP code, year completed, and demographic data to employment services. The first report was scheduled to be released in October 1990.

Proprietary Schools

In 1989, new legislation was passed that requires proprietary schools to submit a substantial amount of data to the State Department of Education. Much of the information must be provided with the license renewal applications. These are submitted annually based on the anniversary date of the each school's license, so they arrive at the state office on a staggered basis. At the current time, reporting is done in a written format but computerized data reporting is expected within the year.

Enrollment and completion information by program is part of the data that the proprietary schools must provide. A completer is someone who graduated from a program or gained a license or certificate. Both full- and part-time students are included, but only a few students attend part time.

Schools also must provide the number of graduates by program who have been placed in occupations related to their training. Schools provide the name of individual students and their employers to the state; the state checks a random sample of these data for accuracy of reporting.

Each year the state will compare the completion and placement rates for each proprietary school and the arithmetic average for completion and placement rates for all schools in the state offering similar programs within the occupational area. If a school fails to maintain completion and placement rates of at least 75 percent of the arithmetic average, it will be put on probation for up to one year. If the school fails to maintain completion and placement rates of at least

75 percent of the average for two consecutive years, the state may revoke the school's license.

Along with license applications, schools must provide the number of students passing the state licensing exam, if applicable. The state requires information on faculty qualifications, facilities and equipment, and school financial condition to be included. Schools must submit copies of their advertising. Records must be available to document any advertising claims about salary and placement. Schools have been required to retract advertisements that touted salary levels higher than a recent graduate could expect to receive.

The state prepares a statistical report with analyses. The proprietary schools are informed that the report exists and may receive a copy on request. General information files are open to the general public, including reporters who make frequent visits. Since proprietary schools are private enterprises, some information is kept confidential. Information is provided to the State Board of Public Education, the executive branch, and the legislature. The state also responds to telephone calls from parents and prospective students. Individual schools must give all prospective students the following information prior to signing an enrollment agreement: 1) total number of students currently enrolled in the program in which the individual is enrolling; 2) number of students who enrolled in the program during the last reporting period; 3) number of students who left the program without completing during the last reporting period; 4) number of students who graduated from the program during the last reporting period; and 5) number of those graduates placed or working in full-time, directly-related occupations.

These efforts are done primarily for consumer rights purposes but some managements decisions are made as a result of them. In addition to the data collection, the state makes site visits to investigate complaints or problems that have arisen. Schools are inspected on an annual basis.

The state uses a series of "at-risk" indicators that suggest if a school is in trouble. These indicators include numerous complaints filed with the state, high student loan default rate, high staff turnover, significant drop in enrollment, low placement rates, and possible financial instability or a poor financial report. When some of these factors begin to occur in a school, school officials must meet with the state in an at-risk interview. If the school cannot rectify the problem, the state begins an orderly process for closing the school and transferring the students to another program or provides assistance in selling the school.

Pennsylvania

Pennsylvania collects information from public schools on number of completers (but not completion rate) and positive placement rates (placements related to training). Analyses are completed by school and program. No data are collected from proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Bureau of Vocational and Adult Education in the Pennsylvania Department of Education oversees the community colleges and branch campuses of the state university, the vocational/technical schools, and proprietary schools. Altogether, 110 of these schools offer vocational programs, 85 of which are eligible for Perkins funding. In 1986-87, the vocational education and postsecondary programs served about 88,000 students.

Public Schools

Information is not collected on how many students start programs, so completion rates cannot be calculated. The state does obtain information on the number of completers--those who graduate with a terminal degree from an approved program. A positive termination placement rate is calculated by comparing the number of completers to the number of students employed in related occupations plus those continuing their education plus those in the military.

Analyses are conducted by school and by program. The state does not prepare a report on this information. Rather, data summaries are made available to a committee that works with the approval of programs and makes funding decisions. The data summaries are available about eight months after the data are collected.

Currently, data collection is primarily a procedural exercise. In the future, the state will be able to defund programs once standards have been established. At present there are no standards.

Before the postsecondary data collection system was implemented, an individual student follow up was done. This was dropped a few years ago. The state has been discussing reimplementing student follow up.

Proprietary Schools

No data are collected from the proprietary schools.

Rhode Island

In Rhode Island, community colleges report number of graduates by six placement categories. For training-related placements, initial wage rates, employer, and position title also are reported by program through annual student mail surveys. For proprietary schools, number of graduates (but not graduation rate) are reported as well as placement rates if used in advertising.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Rhode Island Office of Higher Education is responsible for one community college, which has an enrollment of about 15,000 students in credit courses. The Office also oversees 24 proprietary schools with a total of about 6,000 students.

Public Schools

The community college provides the state with information on the number of graduates by program. A graduate is an individual who has received a degree or certificate. The number of graduates in each of the following placement categories is also submitted: 1) employed full time; 2) employed full time and in an educational program part time; 3) in an educational program full time and employed part time; 4) in an educational program full time; 5) employed part time; 6) unavailable for employment; and 7) unemployed and searching. For graduates who are working in their field of study, initial wage rates, the name of the employer, and position title also are provided. The individual graduates determine if their jobs are related to their training. The information is collected through an annual mail survey of all graduates. A follow-up telephone call is made to graduates who do not respond through the mail.

The information is assembled into a report that has one page for each program. The report is disseminated to high schools, employers, and state agencies. The report is used to inform students and for public relations.

Information on faculty qualifications is collected at the time of hiring and promotion only.

Proprietary Schools

Rhode Island collects information on the number of graduates of proprietary schools but not how many students started; therefore, completion rates cannot be calculated. Placement rates are not routinely collected by the state. If a school wants to put placement rate information in an advertisement, the school must submit student names and telephone numbers to the state. A random sample of the students is telephoned by the state to verify placement. No other measures of performance are collected at the state level.

South Carolina

Institutional effectiveness components consisting of information in 18 areas are being phased in for collection by public postsecondary schools in South Carolina. Performance components include licensing and certification results, program changes as a result of external changes, analysis of undergraduate retention and attrition, and success of entering students in meeting admissions prerequisites. The only data collected from proprietary schools are enrollment numbers at the end of each year.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

In South Carolina, the Commission for Higher Education coordinates 5 two-year colleges, which are governed by the State Board, and 16 technical colleges, which are governed by the State Board for Technical and Comprehensive Education. In FY 1989, the technical colleges enrolled about 32,000 FTE students, which represented about 54,000 individual students. The Commission also licenses the 12 proprietary schools offering associate degrees. The 155 proprietary schools with programs leading toward a certificate or diploma are licensed by the Office of Adult Education in the Department of Education; they enroll about 29,000 students. The 53 vocational/ technical schools are under the State Board of Education, which does not treat secondary and postsecondary students as separate segments. About one-third of the 107,000 vocational/technical students were estimated as being at the postsecondary level.

Public Schools

In 1988, the South Carolina legislature mandated outcomes assessments in 18 areas for all two- and four-year postsecondary schools. Assessment in these areas, called institutional effectiveness components, is to be phased in over four years; not all areas will be assessed annually. The state does not endorse any specific methodological strategy for conducting the assessments. The components include performance of professional program graduates on licensing and certification exams, reports of program changes that have occurred as a result of external program evaluations, alumni follow-up studies, analysis of undergraduate retention and attrition, assessment of administrative and financial processes and performance, and assessment of facilities.

The first report on institutional effectiveness was published in January 1990 and was based on data from the 1988-89 academic year. The report focused on three components--performance of professional program graduates on licensing and certification examinations, reports of program changes occurring as a result of external program evaluation, and success of entering students in meeting college or university admissions prerequisites. The evaluation for each institution was reported separately with each school examining its results in relation to its own goals. Comparisons across schools are discouraged by the state.

The report on institutional effectiveness is disseminated to all institutions, members of the legislature with educational interests, the Governor's office, and members of the general public expressing an interest. The thrust of this assessment effort is program improvement.

The State Board for Technical and Comprehensive Education collects data on the number of students who received a degree, diploma or certificate. Full-time students and part-time students are counted separately. The State Board does not collect earnings information or basic skills gains.

The technical colleges currently submit their data on diskette but the state is in the process of putting all schools on-line. Site visits and telephone calls are made to confirm the data. The board uses the data to prepare an annual report that is submitted to the Commission on Higher Education only. The information is used for program improvements and enhancements; it has resulted in both the revision and discontinuation of some courses.

The State Board of Education does not separate data on secondary and postsecondary students attending vocational/technical programs. The number of students completing a course sequence is collected. Vocational/technical programs are required to achieve a placement rate of at least 50 percent averaged over a three-year period. Placement rate is based on the percentage of completers who are in a related job as determined by the school, in the military, or in a school of higher education. Program reviews are done of 20 percent of the schools each year. During the reviews, a sample of employers is called and earnings information is collected from them.

The vocational/technical schools use state-supported, computer-generated forms to submit the data on an annual basis. On-site program reviews are done to validate the data. For 1988-89, the rate of compliance was 84 percent. The accuracy of the data was more than 95 percent.

The Governor and the legislature are required to receive some of the reports; the information is used in considering legislation changes and amendments. Secondary and postsecondary schools use the reports for program improvement. Although it is public information, the data are neither reported to students and their families nor generally made available from the schools.

The state is in the process of piloting minimum competency testing for every high school vocational course in the state. A similar program is not planned for the postsecondary level.

Proprietary Schools

The only data that the proprietary schools submit to the state are enrollment numbers at the end of each year. The state tries to make one on-site visit to each school every year. During the visit, faculty and student files are reviewed for items such as refunds for dropouts.

South Dakota

A uniform data collection process is under development for public schools in South Dakota as part of a deal of more accountability for more budget flexibility. All aspects of programs are included, such as enrollments, placements, and completion data. Plans to conduct three-year follow ups are under way. Discussions have begun with proprietary schools concerning the need for standard performance measures.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Vocational Education Office in the Division of Education oversees four vocational-technical institutes that enroll about 25,000 students. Recent legislation established the postsecondary option program, which enables high school juniors and seniors to attend vocational/technical schools and receive dual credit.

The proprietary schools in the state are licensed by the North Central Accreditation Agency. The state relies on this agency for assurance of the quality of education offered in these schools.

After the 1989 Presidential Education Summit, the Governor held a series of diagnostic meetings on education in South Dakota. It was found that education was too rigidly academic in focus. As a result, it was recommended that the vocational education budget be increased at both the secondary and postsecondary level. The money is to be used toward increasing the number of programs offered, hiring faculty, and purchasing equipment.

Public Schools

Two years ago, four-year colleges, some of which award associate degrees, were granted budget flexibility in return for accountability.

A uniform data collection process is being developed that will encompass all aspects of the programs involved.

Vocational/technical institutes provide enrollment and completion data to the state. A completer is a full-time student who has finished a program of study as evidenced by a certificate or diploma or through completion of a course sequence. About six months after completion, placement information is collected. The categories of placement utilized are: related/unrelated employment, continuing education, military service, seeking work, not employed, not continuing education, and not seeking work. Plans to conduct three-year follow ups are now under way. Earnings information is not collected by the state but some institutions do it on their own.

Schools submit the placement, enrollment, and completion data in a written format to the state each year. The data are reviewed during product audits that are conducted every four years. The major purpose of the data is for management decision making, e.g., programs with low enrollments have been closed down. The information is used by the postsecondary schools, which must address identified areas of concern. It is not provided to secondary schools or the general public.

Proprietary Schools

The Association of Private Colleges is engaged in an ongoing dialogue with the Governor on the establishment of a long-term plan for higher education in the state. A major focus in this effort is the need for standard performance measures in postsecondary education.

Tennessee

Tennessee uses school performance factors to allocate some supplemental funds to public schools over and above base funding. These performance factors include licensing test results, completion and placement rates (by gender and race), and alumni and employer satisfaction. A computerized student information system tracks each student individually over a six year period; social security numbers are used. Proprietary schools annually report on number of completers and placement rates. New rules provide for collection of number of student complaints, documentation for advertising, enrollment agreements, and annual written reports.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Community Colleges Division of the Tennessee Board of Regents oversees 12 community colleges, 2 technical institutes, and 26 vocational/technical schools. The community colleges and technical institutes award associate degrees and have a combined enrollment of 60,000 students. The Tennessee Higher Education Commission is the licensing agency for 120 nondegree-granting private vocational education institutions.

According to the Tennessee Student Assistance Corporation, the official student loan guarantee agency, Tennessee has a very low student loan default rate. The familiarity between lenders and borrowers was said to be the major reason for this low rate.

Public Schools

In addition to the regular school funding that Tennessee awards to all schools, the state provides some supplemental funding on the basis of each school's performance. Among the factors taken into consideration in the performance-based funding are licensing test results, completion rates, placement rates, alumni satisfaction, and employer satisfaction. As a consequence of the performance-based supplemental funding, substantial information is collected at the state level. The statewide computerized student information system tracks each student individually over a six year period. Social security numbers are also in the system.

Completion rates are calculated on an annual basis, with separate rates calculated by gender and race. A completer is one who has successfully finished a program and received an associate degree, certificate, or diploma. These rates are obtained directly from the computerized student information system.

Schools conduct a survey of students two years after program completion. Survey topics include job placement, the relationship of employment to training, job satisfaction, and earnings level. Placement rates are calculated from this information; these are based on the number employed compared to the number eligible for employment. The number eligible is equal to the number of graduates minus those in military service and those continuing education. A separate placement rate is calculated for completers who are in jobs related to their training; the school decides if the job is training related. These data are provided annually to the state on computer tapes.

The Board of Regents receives information on the success rates on career licensing tests from the schools. Schools also provide information on entry and exit exams that must be given by every program. Licensing results and test scores are factors that are considered for performance-based funding. Performance data are needed by the legislative committee each January to make performance-based funding allocations. Other recipients of the information are the Governor, the postsecondary schools, secondary schools, and the general public. The vocational/technical schools and community colleges use the information to maintain the quality of their programs. Schools must report to the state on how identified deficiencies are being remedied.

The data also are used for management purposes such as resource allocation and revising the curriculum. Decisions on initiating new programs and discontinuing programs are based on performance measures and on reports from the Department of Employment Security of the number of vacancies per field in each district. In 1989, 46 programs were terminated. Additional information is obtained from a survey of employers on their satisfaction with the work performance of graduates.

Proprietary Schools

Information on number of completers is collected annually in the license application form. A completer is defined as one who has completed the course sequence for a program or who did not complete the program but obtained a training-related job. Some schools differentiate between full-time and part-time students. Placement rate data are collected annually as a part of the approval process. Annual site visits are conducted to ensure that schools are meeting their obligations under licensure rules.

In October 1989, the Tennessee Higher Education Commission issued proposed revisions of the rules for private postsecondary education that are expected to be implemented in the near future. In some background information issued along with the proposed revisions, the Commission stated:

> The most significant change is the tuition guaranty fund which will include assessment and collection of funds from private postsecondary vocational educational institutions which provide instruction in Tennessee. Collections will be assessed into a fund (similar to a self-insurance fund) from all such schools currently licensed and from private vocational education institutions which are accredited as degree granting institutions and are exempted from the annual reporting or renewal process.

Other changes in requirements are as follows: annual reporting of the number of formal written student complaints about substantive educational matters, institutional documentation of all advertising claims with information previously filed with the Commission, enrollment agreements between proprietary institutions and each student that list the projected courses necessary for the student to complete for attaining a specific credential, and written annual reports.

Texas

Community colleges in Texas report on success rates on licensing tests and the number of students in the second year of a two-year program, but do not report completion rates. They also report data on the Texas Academic Skills Program, which consists of reading, writing, and mathematics tests. The only data collected by the state from proprietary schools is that necessary for licensing, which does not include any performance measures.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Commission on Higher Education is responsible for 100 community colleges, enrolling approximately 346,000 students. Of the 380 licensed private schools, 250 are members of the Association of Texas Private Schools.

Public Schools

Retention studies on the community colleges provide the Commission on Higher Education with information on the number of students who are in the second year of a two-year program; completion rates are not collected. Placement rates and earnings information are not collected by the Commission, but it does receive information on the success rates in career licensing tests from other state agencies.

Every community college student must participate in the Texas Academic Skills Program, which consists of reading, writing, and math tests. Students who do not pass the tests receive remediation until they do. Data on the Academic Skills program are submitted in a written format to the state six times per year. They are reported to the legislature, school boards, superintendents, and public schools.

Proprietary Schools

At the state level, the only information collected is that necessary for licensing. No performance measures are included.

The Association of Texas Private Schools is just starting to collect information on completion and placement from its members.

Community colleges in Utah submit data on enrollment, completion, placement, and programs offered. Although completion and placement rates are not computed, other measures collected include relationship of placement to training, earning levels, and gains in basic and job skills. One pilot program is attempting to build a data base of student employment information using social security numbers and unemployment wage data. Another is collecting additional employment information through a direct employer survey. Area vocational centers report data on completion, placement, and gains in basic, life, and job skills. Completion rates are not computed, but completion data are broken down by gender, race, and handicapping condition. Due to statutory limitations, the only performance measures the state collects from proprietary schools are completion and placement data, and then only when these data are used in advertising.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Utah's postsecondary vocational education system consists of five community colleges, five area vocational centers that also offer secondary level instruction, and one skills center serving disadvantaged adults. The Area Vocational Centers system is primarily designed for adult needs. It consists of 14 postsecondary institutions which include two community colleges, six junior colleges, five area vocational centers, and one center for disadvantaged adults. The institutions serve approximately 10,000 adults, some of whom receive secondary level instruction. The whole system is competency based. The community colleges and their vocational education programs serve approximately 34,000 students.

The nonpublic sector includes 42 proprietary schools. The current student population in the proprietary schools is undetermined; however, the state's total vocational population is approximately 44,000 students. All public colleges, except one research university, offer vocational programs. Among the proprietary schools, 23 are vocational institutes, 1 awards the associate degree, and the other 18 are trade schools.

The State Board of Regents is the governing board for community colleges. In addition, the Board has statutory authority over operation of proprietary schools and issues Certificates of Registration within legal guidelines. Except for the one skills center that is coordinated through higher education, Area Vocational Centers are governed by the Department of Vocational Education.

Public Schools

Community Colleges. Community colleges that pursue credit programs are eligible for state financial aid. Every five years the state evaluates all programs offered at the colleges. As part of the review, the schools submit data on enrollment, completion, placement, and programs offered. Evaluation reports are used for funding decisions. The state has defunded programs for low enrollment and job demand.

A completer is anyone awarded a certificate, diploma, or associate degree. Although completion and placement rates are not computed, efforts have been made to collect other measures of performance, such as relationship of placement to training, earning levels, and gains in basic and job skills. Currently, gross quarterly earnings are the only income data collected on completers. The State Occupational Information Coordinating Committee (SOICC) is conducting a pilot program aimed at building a data base of student employment information to help identify placement by institution and program, additional earnings information, and to determine training relatedness. The pilot has collected completers' social security numbers and has access to state wage data, welfare offices, and other job services agencies. However, without enabling legislation the confidentiality provisions will impede actual implementation of this program.

Another ongoing pilot program is attempting to collect additional employment information on a sample of 100 completers by a direct employer survey.

Several measures have been instituted to assess gains in basic and job skills. A Clerical Competency Program, designed to gauge clerical competencies by testing students on site under standardized work-setting conditions, was successfully piloted for three years and now is being partially implemented with state funding at school districts. Facilities and equipment are made available at the schools for students to test for a variety of other competencies. Further, competencies gained at high school level, for instance, auto mechanics and computer skills, are now transferable to community colleges. In addition, new vocational students in community colleges with certain work experiences will obtain exemption from course work by examination, and concurrent enrollment at the colleges have been made an option for the high school students.

Site visits are made only for routine product and financial audits. Compliance with information requirements is high.

Collected information such as enrollment and completion figures, programs offered, etc., is published annually in a "Fact Book" of state institutions distributed widely to the general public, lobbyists, as well as the Governor's office, the legislature, and the State Office of Education.

Several new policies have been formulated to enhance the quality of education at the community colleges:

- Community colleges will soon convert to the competency-based system.
- Program advisory committees with a primarily private sector membership have been established to help design curricula according to labor market needs.
- Effective 1992, the Board of Regents will require every postsecondary institution to submit an annual report on its outcome assessment process.
- The directors of area vocational centers were elevated to Dean level.
- State specialists will be assigned to assist in the remedy of identified deficiencies in vocational programs placed on probation.

Area Vocational Centers. The Area Vocational Centers use a competency-based system requiring submission of annual data on completion, placement, and gains in basic, life and job skills. A completer is defined as an individual who has demonstrated competency in a defined and approved instructional sequence that has been designed to prepare students for employment. Students complete programs at their own pace. Completion rates are not computed, but the completion data are broken down by gender, race, and handicapping condition, including the disadvantaged and those of limited-English language skills. Placement data are collected on an individual student basis using standardized demographic identifiers. Individual centers conduct surveys of the employers of completers to determine relationship of placement to training, but the information is not collected at state level.

Assessment of gains in basic, life, and job skills is tailored to individual student needs and continues throughout the training program. Assessment instruments include the Test of Adult Basic Education (TABE). Entry and exit testing also is done. Analysis is done for both individual students and programs.

All data are collected on standardized forms prepared by the Area Vocational Centers office, and on computer tapes. Site visits are conducted regularly during the year, during which product and financial audits are done. Compliance with information requirements is reportedly high, but data accuracy rate is not high, especially the student-specific information. Accuracy monitoring is a year-round activity as a result. Inaccurate data are returned to the centers for corrections or updates.

A newly implemented policy, "Vocational Education Master Plan," requires joint secondary and postsecondary efforts in starting new vocational programs to avoid duplication of programs or curricula. Developed by the State Board of Regents and the Board of Education, the Master Plan prescribes a market-driven vocational education designed to train students in skills for actually existing jobs.

Proprietary Schools

The state does not routinely collect measures of performance from proprietary schools due to statutory limitations. Completion and placement data are collected only from schools that are using the information for advertising purposes. Each school develops its own definition of a completer, which generally includes anyone who completed a program and was awarded a certificate, diploma, or any other credential. However, the Board establishes standards and criteria for awards of educational credentials.

Site visits are conducted primarily to investigate public complaints such as false advertising, poor faculty performance, failure to recover tuition, etc., rather than to verify reported information. Schools found out of compliance must remedy identified deficiencies within a year or face stiff penalties that may include closure. Some proprietary schools have suffered this fate. An amended 1990 legislative initiative broadens the Board of Regents' regulatory authority to include accredited and exempt schools.

A new policy on proliferation of proprietary schools requires a feasibility study determining the labor market need for proposed programs before the school is approved to operate. In addition, schools setting up shop in Utah must have a physical presence in the state before a certificate of registration is issued.

Vermont

The Vermont Technical College reports completion rates and completes a placement report containing placement rates, initial wage rates, and a list of employers who hired graduates. No performance data is collected from the other public and proprietary schools in Vermont.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Division of Adult and Vocational Education in the Department of Education oversees 16 area vocational technical centers, 10 proprietary schools, and 5 thirteenth year certificate programs. The State College System in Vermont includes Vermont Technical College and one community college that does not have any vocational education programs. The Vermont Technical College has about 700 FTE students, most of whom are full-time.

Public Schools

Vocational Technical Centers and Thirteenth Year Certificate Programs. The quality of programs is primarily evaluated by approximately 30 technical committees which review curricula. Schools do not send completion, placement, or earnings information to the state. The state is considering student assessment based on competency per task.

Vermont Technical College. The school receives various requests for completion rates from state agencies. These are calculated by comparing the number of students graduating with the enrollment on a program-by-program basis. Specifics on how these elements are counted depend on the directions with the data request.

The school prepares a placement report containing placement rates, initial wage rates, and a listing of firms that have employed graduates. Students are considered placed if they are employed, joined the military, or transferred to a four-year college. The school tries to do a follow up on students every few years but it is not a formalized procedure. Follow up also may be done as a part of the accreditation process for a particular program.

All incoming students in all state colleges in Vermont are tested in language arts and mathematics. Students who do not meet minimums are placed in developmental classes.

The placement report is sent annually to the State College System, key administrators at the college, and the admissions office. The report is disseminated in October and contains data on students who graduated in May. The information is used informally within the school; program administrators can see which programs are having the most success and can share strategies with their colleagues. The information is not provided to secondary schools in any formal way but the college admissions office is in touch with secondary counselors. The college would give the information to students or potential applicants on request.

Proprietary Schools

Proprietary schools are subject to the same conditions as those for the Vocational Technical Centers and Thirteenth Year Certificate Programs.

Virginia

Public schools in Virginia report the data needed to complete the IPEDS report. A narrative report includes data related to placement, training-related placement, and wages. Number of graduates are reported by sex and race. Programs in proprietary schools that prepare students for unlicensed occupations report data on number of completers and placements each year as well as training-related placements and time needed for program completion. No performance standards are required for certification renewal. For proprietary schools preparing student for licensed occupations, data are reported to the appropriate licensing board.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The administration and monitoring of postsecondary vocational/technical education in Virginia is spread across numerous agencies. The Community College System oversees 23 schools across the state. The Proprietary Schools Service of the State Department of Education oversees 140 schools with programs that do not require a license to practice. Proprietary schools or programs within schools for occupations that require a license are overseen by the board that provides the license.

Public Schools

The quantitative data submitted by the community colleges to the state are the information required to complete the IPEDS report for the National Center of Educational Statistics. Each school also must submit a narrative report to the state each year. Assessment issues are covered in these reports but each school addresses the issues in its own way. Much of the data related to placement, training-related placement, and wages are collected by the individual schools, but they are not reported to the state level and there are no data systems to make it readily accessible. The state provides no standardized definitions for calculating completion or placement rates.

The state compiles an awards booklet that shows the number of graduates broken out by factors such as sex and race from the data collected for IPEDS. Schools can access this information electronically on terminals.

Proprietary Schools

Programs Preparing Unlicensed Students. For programs preparing students for occupations that do not require a license to enter, the proprietary schools are required to send information on the number of completers and the number of placements to the division each year. The number of completers placed in positions related to training also is reported. The individual schools make the determination of whether the placement is training-related. The schools also determine the period of time between completion and the collection of placement information, resulting in considerable variation. The state has attempted to calculate placement rates from the information provided under a standardized definition. The state's calculations are often considerably different from those done by the schools. For example, the schools may not include the following individuals in the count but the state does: those who did not want job placement, those who move from the area, and women who are about to have a baby. The state includes all program completers.

Schools must include this information in their certification renewals but it is not required under any regulations. There are no standards of performance that must be met.

Programs Leading to a License. Programs leading to a license include nursing, geriatric aide, flight instructor, barbering, hairdressing, cosmetology, truck driving, polygraph examiner, real estate, and private security guard. The individual schools report the information on these programs to the various boards involved. For example, the nursing board, which certifies programs in both public and private institutions, requests, but does not require, information on the number of admissions, graduates, and current enrollment. The nursing board also maintains data on licensing test results and can group the data by school.

The data on admissions and graduates is verified every eight years during a site visit. Each year's submission also is compared to the submissions for previous years and anomalies are discussed with the reporting school.

The data collected are reported to the Virginia Board of Nursing and also are mailed to individuals and organizations on the "public participation mailing list," which currently has about 2,000 names. There is no distribution of the report to the general public.

Washington

Community colleges in Washington conduct self-evaluations using the Washington State Higher Education Performance and Evaluation Program. Performance measures reported are training-related placement, license exam passage rates, and student and employer ratings of effectiveness. Placement matching is done using student social security numbers and the state unemployment insurance data base. This will enable collection of employment status and earnings, and training-related placement determination. Both employer and student surveys are used. Completion rate is not deemed to be important. Vocational technical institutes are not participating in the performance evaluation program, but do report on number of enrollees and completers. They also survey students to obtain placement and training-related placement rates as well as earnings data. Proprietary schools are not required to submit any performance measures.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Within the state of Washington, there are 27 community colleges that graduate approximately 1,500 people per year in vocational/technical programs. These schools are monitored at the state level by the Washington State Board for Community College Education. In addition, there are 5 vocational/technical institutes that offer programs to adults. The institutes are administered by the Superintendent of Public Instruction and offer preparatory training for entry into a trade, training to upgrade or retrain those already working, provide apprenticeships, and short-term training in consumer and homemaking skills. The Vocational Education Board oversees the 167 proprietary schools and 1 nonprofit public trust vocational school.

Public Schools

Community Colleges. In 1989, the state of Washington initiated the Washington State Higher Education Performance and Evaluation Program. The goal of the project is to provide information for self-evaluation by the institutions and for accountability. The program involves three measures of program effectiveness: training-related placement and success in licensure exams, employer ratings of effectiveness, and student ratings of effectiveness.

The information for the measurement of effectiveness will come from a variety of sources. Information on placements will be obtained by matching community college students' social security numbers with social security numbers in the state wage data data base. The community colleges are required to provide the social security numbers of all students who have attended each institution and to indicate whether each completed the program or not. Arrangements also have been made to gain access to data from the state wage data bases of neighboring states. From this database it will be possible to determine whether the former student is currently employed or has been employed since leaving the school, hours employed, earnings, industry code, and county of employment. From the earnings data, an estimated annual wage will be calculated. The assessment of whether the employment is training-related will be made by cross-referencing Classification of Instructional Program (CIP) codes with industry SIC codes.

A second source of information will be an employer survey. Employers will be identified from the matches with the state wage data files. The employers will be asked about the degree to which they believe the community college system is producing students with competency in a variety of areas, and are able to apply their classroom training to the job situation. Approximately 3,000 employers will be surveyed each year. There will be a rotation by industry, so that any given industry will be surveyed only every third year.

A third source of information will be the survey of a random sample of 800 students who left the community college system between 18 months and 3 years previously. The students will be asked about the quality and relevance of their education.

State wage data do not contain information on those who have gone on for more education, entered the military, are self-employed, or are employed by the Federal government. To develop estimates of the value of the vocational training received for these students and employers, a survey of a sample of those who do not appear in the state wage data data bases will be conducted every five years. Both completers and those who left before completing but are employed will be surveyed.

The calculation of a completion rate does not receive much attention in Washington. About half of the students in the community college system obtain jobs before they complete their programs. It is felt these jobs are usually training-related and they are considered successful placements. Some of these students have completed all of their course work but have not yet paid a $10 fee for a diploma, so they are not technically classified as completers.

As part of the comprehensive performance evaluation, more information on success with career licensing will be collected.

Currently, most of the career licensing boards have no data bases. In two years the state expects to be able to obtain career licensing information on 7 of the 14 occupational areas that are licensed.

The information collected will be provided to the Higher Education Coordinating Board and will be provided to the schools. The individual schools will be free to determine whether to disclose information to students or prospective students. The exact reporting format is under discussion.

Procedures for monitoring compliance with this requirement or for assessing data accuracy have not been established. It is hoped that by using the state wage data, the need to establish elaborate and burdensome requirements for information collection and reporting by the schools will be avoided.

Vocational Technical Institutes. These schools are not participating in the performance evaluation program, although there is discussion underway about using state wage data to assess placement and earnings of program completers. The schools currently collect information on the number of enrollees and the number of completers and report it to the state. They also conduct a survey of completers to determine placement rate, which includes self-reports of training-related placement and earnings.

The results of this annual survey are reported to the State Board of Vocational Education as part of an annual performance report. This report is provided to the Governor, the office of financial management, and the legislature. The report is not automatically distributed to the schools, but is sent if requested. The information also is available to the public on request.

Proprietary Schools

At the present time, proprietary schools are not required to submit performance measures to the state, and these schools do not participate in the performance evaluation program. There is discussion of incorporating requirements for the collection and reporting of the measures listed in the Stafford loan regulations. Thirty percent of the licensed schools are accredited and therefore participate in the loan program.

Previously, the state has not felt much need to become more systematically involved in the assessment of the performance of these schools. Most are located in small communities; when graduating students from a particular school or program within a school aren't placed, "news travels fast" and students make responsible enrollment decisions.

West Virginia

In the past, West Virginia collected performance outcome data from public school postsecondary graduates earning associate degrees through surveys asking about current placement, preparation for employment, present employer, job title, and relationship of employment to training. These surveys were dropped due to low response rates. For proprietary schools, the state collects information on number of students completing, but not starting, programs by sex. They also collect the number of training-related job placements.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Postsecondary vocational education in West Virginia is administered by the Division of Vocational, Technical and Adult Education within the State Department of Education. There are 11 community colleges, enrolling approximately 25,000 students. There are 52 proprietary schools; the state is in the process of collecting the number of students attending these schools.

Public Schools

In the past, follow-up surveys were made of associate degree graduates. The surveys, based on the old Vocational Education Data System (VEDS) form, asked about current placement, the name of the present employer when applicable, job title, and preparation for employment. Graduates also would indicate if they were employed in jobs related to their training; their responses were cross-checked with their job titles. Employers who were named by the graduates received a survey that asked about satisfaction with the employee and salary range.

The surveys were done about every three years. Sometimes the state mailed them directly. Last time, the schools sent out the forms and the state paid for the postage. This change was made in an effort to improve the response rate but it had little effect. The state does not expect to conduct these surveys in the near future unless it is mandated to do so.

Programs are evaluated every four or five years. The information is used by the Governor, the legislature, the State Board of Education, the postsecondary schools, and the secondary schools, but not to students and their families. These evaluations are done to make management decisions; many programs have been terminated.

Proprietary Schools

The state collects the number of students completing, but not starting, programs. The number of women completers also is obtained. The number of students placed in jobs related to their field of study as determined by the schools is collected as well.

The schools provide the data annually to the state in a written format. Data reporting occurs about four months after data collection. The information is used by the accrediting agency and the State Department of Education mainly to make management decisions.

Wisconsin

Enrollment data and placement rates are reported by public schools each year in Wisconsin. Employment rates, training-related placements rate, and earnings also are reported. These data are collected through a graduate survey, with a required survey completion rate. A 1989 longitudinal study of the earnings of graduates of vocational, technical, and adult education examined the feasibility of using state income tax and wage reporting data as performance measures. Proprietary schools must indicate the number of students beginning and completing each program on their license renewal applications, with placement rates if they are used in advertising.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Wisconsin has 16 technical colleges that enroll 60,000 full time equivalent (FTE) students in degree programs and have additional students in nondegree programs. The technical colleges are overseen by the Board of Vocational, Technical and Adult Education. The state does not have community colleges. It does have two-year centers that feed into the University of Wisconsin system and do not grant degrees.

The Educational Approval Board is the licensing agency for postsecondary proprietary schools except cosmetology and barbering. Technically, any school that has solicitors in Wisconsin or advertises in the state must have a license even if the school is not located in Wisconsin. Wisconsin licenses 85 schools, with about 65 to 70 of these are located in the state. These range from a neon sign-making school to a for-profit MBA program. Only about 10 to 15 of the schools are accredited, and therefore have students that are eligible for federal aid.

Public Schools

Each year the number of graduates in full-time degree programs is collected by the state. Enrollment data for full-time and part-time students also is obtained. Completion rates are not calculated, but it is expected that half of the students in the full-time degree program will graduate each year.

Placement rates are calculated based on the number of graduates divided by the number in the labor pool; those who are not looking for employment are excluded. Two additional calculations are made: 1) the percentage of those in the market who are employed, and 2) the percentage of those employed who are in jobs related to their training. Monthly salary rates also are requested of graduates. The state publishes salary ranges and median salaries for graduates who are employed full time in jobs related to their training.

Placement and earnings information are collected in the standard survey that the schools send to all graduates six months after graduation. The schools must have an 80 percent response rate for the survey or show three attempts to contact nonrespondents. The graduates return the survey to the schools, which put the data on computer (tape, disk, or on-line). The data are submitted to the state, which compiles the data by program and produces a statewide report. The colleges may do their own report; the information may differ from the state report in that different methods may be used to do the calculations. Three-year and five-year follow ups are done on some classes. The career licensing boards are used as a resource for updated addresses for the follow-up surveys.

Success rates in career licensing tests are not required, but schools are encouraged to provide this information and an increasing number are doing so. Schools are asked to send as many measures of impact as possible. Scores on basic skills tests are reported only for basic skills projects.

The data are presented in a graduate follow-up report. From October through December, data are collected on students who graduated the previous December and May. The data are submitted to the state in January and the report becomes available in April.

The state does not go on-site to monitor the accuracy of the data nor does it verify student follow-up information. Graduation rates over time are reviewed; programs that are experiencing difficulties receive an in-depth evaluation. Programs have been discontinued and major curriculum modifications have occurred as a result of these efforts, e.g., last year a welding program was discontinued.

The Governor and the legislature get copies of the report and ask questions about the information. The postsecondary schools and all secondary counselors receive copies. The report is available upon request to students and the general public. The report is primarily used for making management decisions.

In 1989, the University of Wisconsin did a longitudinal study of the earnings of graduates of Vocational, Technical and Adult Education (VTAE) from the 1982-83 school year. The purpose of the study was to determine the feasibility of using state income tax information and the state wage data reporting system instead of self-reporting techniques to provide performance measures of graduates. Data on the graduates consisted of social security number, gender, age, program instructional area, length of instruction, district in which the instruction was obtained, and whether or not financial aid was received. Student data were matched against income records filed with the State Department of Revenue for the 1985 tax year. Unemployment compensation received and residence by zipcode also were collected for 1985. In addition, data from the 1988 wage reporting system, administered by the Department of Industry, Labor and Human Relations, were compared to 1982-83 student data. Researchers then developed a comparison group against which the 1982-83 graduates could be measured. This group was based on 1985 census data that was then adjusted to conform to the age and gender distribution of the 1982-83 graduates and to the ratio of earnings in the state compared to the nation as a whole.

Proprietary Schools

Proprietary schools must submit license renewal applications on a yearly basis. In the applications they must show the number of students who began and the number who completed each program during the previous year. Completion rates are not calculated but the number of completers could be compared over time.

Placement rates are not reported to the state. However, if a school makes claims in an advertisement, it must have records to back them up; these will be checked during an inspection. The state law is very strict about reporting, therefore, most schools do not make claims. Schools are not required to report earnings information. The state tries to visit each school every two years or if problems arise. During an inspection, officials review student records, check enrollments, make sure that refunds are made on time, and try to interview students.

No report is generated from the information that is collected. Some of the postsecondary schools make use of the data. The information is available for other audiences but there have not been any requests. Generally, if a program has a problem, it will show up sooner in student complaints than it will in the enrollment data.

Wyoming

The only performance measures collected at the state level in Wyoming from community colleges are the measures from IPEDS reports. No performance measures are collected at the state level for proprietary schools.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

Wyoming has 32 postsecondary and higher education institutions that include the University of Wyoming, seven community colleges offering associate degrees and a few vocational/technical programs, and 17 proprietary schools. Public vocational training is primarily delivered at secondary level under 49 autonomous school districts. The state has no public postsecondary area vocational schools; as a result, regional vocational centers outside the state are utilized widely. Consequently, the state funds frequent travel of vocational counsellors to recruiting drives at vocational centers in neighboring Colorado, Idaho, Montana, and Utah.

Wyoming's 17 proprietary schools offer vocational/technical programs to an estimated 2,260 students. The State Board of Education oversees the proprietary schools through statutory licensure authority. These students will become eligible for state financial aid effective October 1990 under a revised state law.

Public Schools

The State Commission on Community Colleges oversees the seven participating institutions. The only measures of performance collected at state level are the IPEDS reports, which are copied in the state office before being forwarded to NCES. The completer is strictly one awarded the associate degree, diploma, or certificate of completion. Individual schools districts submit performance outcomes in vocational education collected through completer surveys conducted by instructors. The information collected identifies the local dropout rate and rationale, and the kinds of postsecondary schools or employment students enter after completion.

Historically, the legislature is reported to have taken very little interest in the need to improve vocational/technical education in general. This is reported to have been exacerbated by contemporary factors such as the state's depressed economic conditions mainly triggered by a declining oil market, and the resultant brain drain. Most recently the state has moved to eliminate the Division of Vocational Education altogether from the Department of Education. Previous considerations to transfer all oversight responsibility of vocational education to the Department of Labor effective July 1990 also have been terminated.

Proposed legislation promises to change this picture by upgrading quality and increasing availability of statewide vocational education at all levels. The bill seeks to establish an 11-member Vocational Education Task Force to evaluate current state policy of funding vocational programs through local school districts, investigate alternative funding mechanisms, and submit an interim study report with preemptive policy recommendations. The task force also would redefine Wyoming's vocational education needs to respond to existing business community needs, and in terms of emerging technologies and changing labor market demands, thus steering away from the traditional agriculture-oriented curricula that historically have dominated the state's vocational training programs. The task force would further develop minimum education standards and objectives for vocational/technical programs, establish accountability requirements with an assessment criteria, and articulate necessary state oversight. The task force membership would include representation from the business sector, legislature, state government, secondary and postsecondary vocational education instructors and administrators, parents of the students, and the at-large community.

Reportedly because of the prevailing attitudes toward vocational education, the bill failed House introduction in the early 1990 session. An amended version was to be introduced in the Senate. Its heaviest opposition reportedly emanates from the State Department of Education, which not only wishes to preserve the status quo and its vocational funding policy, but also contends that it is not a function of the legislature to conduct education studies of any kind.

Proprietary Schools

Measures of performance are not collected at state level from proprietary schools as these are not a condition for licensing. However, license requirements stipulate that anyone who satisfactorily completes a training program be issued with a certificate. Study by correspondence is permitted.

Puerto Rico

In Puerto Rico, state-level reporting from public postsecondary schools includes enrollment data and number of completers, broken down by gender, type of institution, and economic classifications. Completion and placement rates and relationship to training are not computer due to high unemployment rates. An outcome assessment mechanism has been instituted recently mandating schools to submit five-year follow-up data on completers and graduates. Vocational/technical institutes annually report data on completion, placement, relationship of placement to training, and earnings levels. The only performance data collected from proprietary schools are enrollment and completion data at the beginning and end of each year.

Organization of Postsecondary Vocational Education

The Commonwealth of Puerto Rico has an estimated 1,148 postsecondary institutions serving roughly 350,000 students. The nonpublic sector includes 24 two- and four-year colleges and 10 specialized, serving 130,000 students with all overseen by the Commission on Higher Education. The 14 vocational/technical institutes are governed by the Department of Education's Office of Vocational Programs.

There are 1,089 proprietary schools serving an estimated 200,000 students. Those granting associate degrees are licensed through the Commission on Higher Education, and the rest by the Puerto Rico Approving Agency of Private Schools.

Public Schools

The funding breakdown for Puerto Rico's public sector institutions is one-third from Carl Perkins Act and two-thirds from state funds. The Commission on Higher Education annually collects enrollment data and total number of completers by programs, based upon tabulations of responses to standard form questions it prepares for the schools. A completer is anyone awarded the associate degree with a 2.0 minimum cumulative grade point average. Completion rates are not calculated. Data are broken down by gender, and to facilitate other analyses, further by economic classification and type of college (public or private college). Placement rates and relationship to training are not assessed as the state's chronically high unemployment rate would render such data invalid. On-site verification is conducted every four years for accreditation purposes.

The Commonwealth recently has instituted a variety of policy measures designed to improve and record performance outcomes. An outcome assessment mechanism established for the public sector mandates participating schools to submit five-year follow-up data of completers and graduates. Ongoing discussions with the accreditation agencies seek to get the state outcome assessment requirements incorporated into the accreditation process. Further, policy measures require schools to justify programs in terms of community and labor market needs. Declining enrollment has eliminated certain electronics and business education programs, and changing labor market needs have increased demand for computer and health technology programs such as physical therapy, radio therapy, etc. The schools also will submit data on retention trends. A standard definition of retention is being developed to include transfer students. The state has ascertained that 70 percent of first year students in public institutions do not enter the second year.

These efforts are designed to serve management decision making as well as consumer rights purposes. Collected information is used to compile an annual report on postsecondary institutions showing enrollment and completion data by program. Copies go to the Governor, the legislature, participating institutions, and the general public.

Measures of performance are collected annually from the 14 nondegree-granting, vocational/technical institutes through site visits by industrial coordinators. Collected information includes data on completion, placement, relationship of placement to training, and earnings levels. No site visits are conducted for data accuracy verification due to staff shortage.

A completer is anyone who has finished required training hours and internship for a program and subsequently was awarded a certificate. The industrial coordinator is also responsible for placement, in consultation with the State Department of Labor (DOL). Hence, the completion and placement data are broken down in terms of services completers will need. A state DOL representative participates in the placement effort by interviewing completers and matching them with training-related jobs listed with the DOL. The highest placement levels occur for completers of technical, marketing, and distribution programs. The relationship of placement to training and initial wage levels are determined through follow-up studies conducted one and two years after placement.

The analyses of collected information are disseminated in an annual report prepared jointly with the Puerto Rico Occupational Information Coordinating Committee and the Department of Labor.

New measures are under consideration to enhance the quality of public vocational training in Puerto Rico. A current policy proposal seeks to integrate academic basic skills in all vocational/technical programs and later include these in outcome assessment. The proposal seeks to hire occupational counselors for all vocational centers to help assess students' ability to benefit from self-selected programs. Technical programs currently assess basic skills at entry and have prepared remedial courses in Spanish, English, mathematics, physics, and communications. Plans also are underway to collect annual data on success rates in career licensing tests as a measure of program quality. Other plans include: the establishment of an academic track professional development unit to improve teacher competencies, curricula revisions responding to the needs of emerging technologies, and regular updates of existing facilities and equipment.

Proprietary Schools

Only enrollment and completion data early in the year and at year end are collected from the proprietary schools, using a standard form prepared by oversight agencies. A completer is the recipient of an associate degree, or anyone who either obtained a certificate in an occupational area or completed all training hours for a given program. Collected information is broken down by gender.

Site visits for the proprietary schools are conducted every four years, during which all operations of the institution are reviewed for license renewal. Additional visits are made promptly to investigate student grievances. Schools failing to submit required information also undergo investigative reviews. Noncompliance with reporting information is somewhat high. Such schools generally have expired certification and consequently missed the state mailing list for reporting forms. Data inaccuracies are remedied by telephone and written memos. Schools are mostly cooperative. Statutory provisions mandate that all deficiencies be remedied in six months or the violator faces loss of license.

The information collection effort is aimed at both management decisions and consumer rights purposes. The State Office of Information and Statistics uses the data to compile two statistical reports: the annual report on private school enrollment, published early in the year, and the Statistical Annual Report, which includes enrollment and completion data for both private and public schools and is released at the end of the year. The state also publishes an annual directory of licensed schools and programs offered. In addition, a public affairs office answers public inquiries on the status of any proprietary school. All compiled reports are distributed to the Governor, the legislature, and the general public.

Site visits to degree-granting proprietary schools are conducted primarily for program evaluation. Student complaints against a school generate additional investigative visits during the review cycle. Programs are evaluated on individual basis. New programs are evaluated twice: before introduction and four years later. The program-specific review process is designed to correct all deficiencies at once. It, therefore, covers diverse areas such as viability data, student profile after graduation, curriculum, faculty qualifications, facilities and equipment, and placement data when used in school recruiting activities.

Noncompliance with information requirements is a regular occurrence among the institutions. The highest rate is found in the area of facilities and equipment (i.e., libraries, technical appliances, etc.), curriculum revision, and faculty qualifications. Several programs have been closed down for violation of these and other licensure requirements.

Evaluative reports based on site visit reviews are supplied to participating schools, who in turn use them in marketing activities. Truth in advertising is strictly monitored, and the state maintains an advertising tracking office for this purpose. False advertising leads to prosecution and eventual loss of license. This punitive outcome was said to occur frequently.

Students in proprietary schools are eligible for only portions of state financial aid. These include 50 percent of funds in the Puerto Rico Education Fund earmarked for public and private institutions, and 15.6 percent of the legislated scholarships.

At the moment the state has no proposed or pending legislation addressing the issue of consumer rights information in postsecondary education.

IV. INFORMATION MATRIX

To provide the results of the overview in a more accessible form and to make patterns and comparisons more readily identifiable, the key information elements are arrayed in a series of matrices. The matrices are designed to complement the narrative summaries and present information consistent with those summaries.

Column Definitions

In developing the matrices, project staff sought to identify the most critical information elements to serve as column headings. A procedure for coding the states on each column was developed to ensure accurate interpretation of the information presented. A summary of the coding procedure for each column is presented below.

Outcome Measures Collected at State Level

This section of the matrix refers to efforts to collect specific outcome measures about training program leavers. Both efforts at the state level to collect the information directly, or efforts resulting from requirements that the information be collected by the schools or instructors and forwarded to the state are included. Information efforts conducted by schools on their own initiative and never sent to the state, or sent to the state on the school's initiative are not included.

Completion. This column indicates whether information on the number of completers is collected at the state level. A state is coded as "Yes" if any counts of students completing a program are required to be reported to the state. A state could be coded as "Yes" regardless of the definition of a completer used and whether a standardized definition was used statewide. A state also could be coded as "Yes" even if the completion counts were not used to compute a completion rate.

Placement. This column indicates whether information on the number of persons formerly attending postsecondary vocational education programs who are subsequently employed is collected at the state level. As with the completion counts, a state is coded as "Yes" if any counts of job attainment are reported to the state, regardless of the definition of a placement or of the categories of former students for whom counts are obtained.

Training Related Placement. This column shows whether the report on placement information contains any indication of whether the job attained is related to the content of the vocational training received. Any effort, without judgment by project staff of its validity, was coded as "Yes."

Earnings Information. Any effort to collect information on the earnings of individuals who had attended the training program was coded as "Yes." Either efforts to measure initial wage levels or follow-up information at some later point, such as 5 years after leaving the training program, would be included. A "Yes" also is given regardless of the source of the information, whether it be a survey of program leavers or employers, or the use of third-party information.

Licensing. This column indicates whether information on the performance of completers and possibly other program attendees is collected for programs in the licensed trades. This includes whether information is sent directly from the licensing board to the relevant state agency, or whether the information is reported to the schools and then forwarded.

Gains in Basic Skills or Job Knowledge. If efforts are made to assess gains in basic skills or in knowledge specifically related to the occupation for which students are being trained, a "Yes" is entered in this column. An assessment must be made at two points in time during a student's time in the training program to be considered an assessment of gains. The use of basic skills tests by proprietary schools at program entry only to establish the potential for benefiting from the program is not included.

Use of External Data. This column is marked "Yes" if external data sources are used by the schools or state to provide any information on placement, on whether the placement is training related, or on earnings. State wage data and data from IRS are two of the external sources used by the states.

Follow-Up Survey. This column refers to efforts to gain information from training program completers (and sometimes leavers who did not complete the program) or their employers through a survey. Included are sample surveys or attempts at a census, and all surveys are included regardless of the interval after the students leave the program. The content of the surveys usually include information on placement, whether the placement is training related, and student and employer satisfaction.

Statewide Standard Definition. A "Yes" in this column means that the definition of at least one of the performance measures is established by the state oversight agency to be used consistently throughout the state. Evidence of a standard definition includes the use of a state data form, publication of a definition in state documents, or indications from respondents that information supplied is consistent throughout the state.

Other Characteristics of Outcome Measurement

Data Uses. Two types of data uses are entered on the matrix: management and consumer rights. Management refers to the utilization of the data for state administrative purposes such as decisions about the funding or defunding of schools and programs, the licensing of schools, or preparing reports for the state legislature. Consumer rights uses indicate that some report that would allow comparisons of the outcome data across schools is available to potential students, their parents, and the general public. This would include having the information distributed to secondary schools, to libraries, or available upon request.

Data Verification. This column is marked "Yes" when independent data collection is regularly done by the state or when third-party data are used as a major information source. A site visit to a school to review the data is shown as a "No" unless additional data are collected during the site visit. Infrequent verification efforts by the state, e.g., once every five years, also are marked as "No."

Recently Placed Into Effect. A "Yes" is entered if any of the outcome measures were added or changed within the last two years.

Pending Changes. Possible changes that have not yet gone into effect are described in this column. These include changes being discussed by the state legislature or oversight agency, legislative changes for which rules or regulations are being written, changes that have been developed but not yet implemented, and new student tracking systems that are under development.

The Matrices

The indicators selected to be included in the matrix were those judged to provide the best descriptive information about the practices and policies in program outcome measurement in each state. The number of elements that could be included was constrained by the desire to concentrate the presentation of information into one location.

The constraints of size in the presentation of the matrix versus the number of elements selected t be presented resulted in the decision to prepare one matrix for public institutions, and one for proprietary institutions. Because the outcome measurement policies for community colleges and vocational/technical schools was similar in most states, these two components have been combined. For each column of the matrix, if either the community colleges or vocational/technical schools could be coded as a "Yes" a yes is entered. The state narratives presented above provide more detailed information about any differences between these components.

MATRIX OF INFORMATION ON STATE ACTIVITIES IN THE COLLECTION AND USE OF OUTCOME MEASURES

PUBLIC													
	OUTCOME MEASURES COLLECTED AT STATE LEVEL							DATA SOURCES					
STATE	COMPLETION	PLACEMENT	TRAINING RELATED PLACEMENT	EARNINGS	LICENSURE	GAINS IN BASIC/JOB SKILLS	STATEWIDE STANDARD DEFINITIONS	USE STATE WAGE-DATA	FOLLOW-UP SURVEY	DATA VERIFICATION	DATA USES	CHANGE DURING 1988 OR 1989	PENDING CHANGES
AL	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	None	No	Student Database
AK	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Management	No	
AZ	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Management	Yes	New Outcomes Requirements
AR	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management	No	New Outcomes Requirements
CA	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	None	No	
CO	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Management Consumer Rights	Yes	Faculty Surveys
CT	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management Consumer Rights	No	
DE	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	None	No	
DC	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
FL	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Management	Yes	
GA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management Consumer Rights	No	
HI	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management	No	
ID	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management Consumer Rights	No	
IL	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Management Consumer Rights	No	Use of State Wage Data
IN	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Management	Yes	
IA	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management	Yes	
KS	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Management Consumer Rights	No	Employer Survey
KY	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Management	No	

MATRIX OF INFORMATION ON STATE ACTIVITIES IN THE COLLECTION AND USE OF OUTCOME MEASURES

PUBLIC													
	OUTCOME MEASURES COLLECTED AT STATE LEVEL							DATA SOURCES					
STATE	COMPLETION	PLACEMENT	TRAINING RELATED PLACEMENT	EARNINGS	LICENSURE	GAINS IN BASIC/JOB SKILLS	STATEWIDE STANDARD DEFINITIONS	USE STATE WAGE-DATA	FOLLOW-UP SURVEY	DATA VERIFICATION	DATA USES	CHANGE DURING 1988 OR 1989	PENDING CHANGES
LA	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Management	Yes	Automating "Voc" Info network
ME	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Management	No	
MD	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management Consumer Rights	No	
MA	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Management	No	Basic skills testing
MI	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	Yes	Management	No	
MN	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management	Yes	
MS	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Management	No	
MO	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Management	No	Performance Indicators
MT	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Management	No	Uniform Data System
NE	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Management	No	
NV	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	None	No	Self Assessment 1991
NH	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Management	No	
NJ	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	Management Consumer Rights	No	
NM	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management Consumer Rights	Yes	
NY	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management	No	
NC	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Management	Yes	Effectiveness Data Base 1990
ND	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Management	No	
OH	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management Consumer Rights	Yes	

*U.S. GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE 1991-295-514

MATRIX OF INFORMATION ON STATE ACTIVITIES IN THE COLLECTION AND USE OF OUTCOME MEASURES

PUBLIC													
	OUTCOME MEASURES COLLECTED AT STATE LEVEL							DATA SOURCES					
STATE	COMPLETION	PLACEMENT	TRAINING RELATED PLACEMENT	EARNINGS	LICENSURE	GAINS IN BASIC/JOB SKILLS	STATEWIDE STANDARD DEFINITIONS	USE STATE WAGE-DATA	FOLLOW-UP SURVEY	DATA VERIFICATION	DATA USES	CHANGE DURING 1988 OR 1989	PENDING CHANGES
OK	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Management	No	
OR	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	None	No	Basic Skills Testing
PA	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Management	No	
RI	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Management Consumer Rights	No	
SC	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	Yes	Management	Yes	Institutional Effectiveness
SD	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Management	Yes	
TN	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Management Consumer Rights	Yes	
TX	No	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	Management	No	
UT	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Management Consumer Rights	Yes	Statewide Voc Ed Master Plan
VT	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Management	No	
VA	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Management	No	
WA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Management	Yes	Licensure data added to system
WV	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Management	No	
WI	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Management	No	
WY	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	No	Management	No	
PR	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Management Consumer Rights	Yes	Basic Skills Testing
# Yes	46	33	27	21	12	13	42	6	28	20		16	

208

209